

**CITY OF ORANGE
DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
MINUTES – FINAL**

March 20, 2019

Committee Members Present: Anne McDermott - Chair
Mary Anne Skorpanich – Vice Chair
Tim McCormack
Carol Fox
Robert Imboden

Staff in Attendance: Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner
Chad Ortlieb, Senior Planner
Monique Schwartz, Associate Planner
Jessica Wang, Administrative Specialist
Simonne Fannin, Recording Secretary

Administrative Session – 5:03 p.m.

Chair McDermott opened the Administrative Session at 5:03 p.m. and inquired about Policy/Procedural Information.

Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner, informed the Committee of the following:

- A vote is not required to adjourn the meeting; the Chair shall adjourn the meeting without a motion.
- Staff recommends that public comment be limited to three minutes per speaker. If the Chair wishes to extend the time limit, the same time courtesy shall be given to all speakers.
- Edison agreed to lower the light fixtures in Old Town from 4000 Kelvin to 3000.
- The Committee's form 700 is due March 21, 2019.

The Committee provided edits to the February 20, 2019 and March 6, 2019 minutes.

Chair McDermott adjourned the administrative session 5:17 PM

Regular Session – 5:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Committee Members McCormack, Imboden, Skorpanich, McDermott, and Fox were present.

FLAG SALUTE:

Vice Chair Skorpanich led the flag salute.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION:

Opportunity for members of the public to address the Design Review Committee on matters not listed on the Agenda.

There were no speakers.

CONSENT ITEMS:

(1) APPROVAL OF MINUTES: February 20, 2019 and March 6, 2019

Committee Member Fox made a motion to approve the February 20, 2019 and March 6, 2019 minutes as emended in the Administrative Session.

SECOND: Skorpanich
AYES: McCormack, Skorpanich, McDermott, Fox, and Imboden
NOES: None
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

MOTION CARRIED.

AGENDA ITEMS:

Continued Items:

(3) DRC No. 4959-18, Sunrise Senior Assisted Living & Memory Care

- A proposal to demolish an existing 13,414 square foot office building to construct a 93-unit, 120 bed, 75,514 square foot, senior assisted living and memory care facility with 62 covered parking spaces. Concessions and waivers are requested under State Density Bonus Law for exceeding the floor area ratio and number of stories.
- 1301 E. Lincoln Ave.
- Staff Contact: Chad Ortlieb, (714) 744-7237, cortlieb@cityoforange.org
- DRC Action: Recommendation to the Planning Commission

Chad Ortlieb, Senior Planner, provided an overview of the project's revisions consistent with the staff report.

Greg McCafferty, applicant, introduced the architect, Thomas Concialdi, and asked him to provide an overview of the revised architectural elements.

Mr. Concialdi provided an overview of the following:

- The front façade design around Lincoln and changes to the window treatments to provide more of a residential feel. The scale of the project integrates better with the proposed landscaping.
- Revisions to roof plans to mimic the proposed slopes. The tower element has been relocated and the roof access has been moved closer to Lincoln Avenue and the park.
- Reconfiguration of the elevator vestibule.
- Enhanced landscaping in the entry court that allows space for delivery service or additional cars during drop off or pickup.
- Changes to the wall/fence on the alley access; a solid fence for the majority of the length that is lowered in the setback, approximately 10 to 15 feet from Oceanview.

Jim Ridge, landscape architect, provided an overview of the following revisions based on the Committee's prior comments:

- Planting of larger trees.
- Narrowing of the walkway to maximize the planter area and provide softness.
- Eliminating the retaining wall from the sidewalk along Lincoln Avenue to provide more landscaping.
- Courtyard changes.
- Up-lighting trees and safety lighting.

Mr. McCafferty stated they are in agreement with all of the conditions of approval with the exception of the 6 foot high fence on the north elevation; they would prefer a solid fence for security and privacy.

Chair McDermott opened the public comment portion of the meeting; there were no speakers.

The Committee had questions and comments on the following:

- The mass and scale is still a major concern.
- The number of concessions and waivers. Mr. Ortlieb stated they qualify for up to three waivers or reductions which will be used for the height and stories of the building. He explained the density bonus. Mr. McCafferty stated state law mandates that cities allow a 20% density bonus for qualified senior project and they are doing 10%.
- The tree count in terms of what it is recommended and what is provided.
- Mr. Concialdi provided clarity on their reason for the use of Canary Island Pine trees. The Committee provided their opinion of the proposed trees and their sizes.
- The 6 foot solid wood fence should be enhanced to be visually appealing on both sides of the property. Wrought iron is preferable in order to feel like the plant materials are part of the alley. Philip Kroskin, the Senior Vice President of the applicant company, agreed to find solutions to break up the solid fence.
- Roof sheds on the north of the building have not been revised. Mr. Concialdi responded that instead of using the hip roof they are bringing the articulation and language of the shed roof found on Lincoln to that portion of the building.
- The alternate pitch roof facing the park has not changed. The shed roofs are not in keeping with the rest of the project or neighborhood.
- Concerns with the north elevation being the back of house and the interface with the neighborhood at the alley and how the project looks to the neighborhood. Mr. Kroskin responded there is only one home that looks at the fence on the north elevation. The height of the project's roofline is the same as the adjacent properties.
- The size of the entry radius could be enlarged.
- Safety implications by creating a drop off adjacent to a drive aisle. People will unknowingly back up into the space against a solid wood fence, which will have a 10-foot drop off behind it. It also poses safety concerns for animals that may jump over the fence into the 10-foot drop off. Mr. McCafferty stated the project was evaluated by three SMART Committee reviews; no safety concerns were noted regarding the fence.
- The large box trees are placed in front of windows which minimize views, especially on Oceanview.
- Landscaping is still not strong enough to meet the architecture.
- Condition #15, regarding the trees, is not appropriate.
- No neighborhood outreach has been conducted.
- Who will maintain the alley? Mr. Ortlieb responded that it is a public alley maintained by the City and noted Community Development Condition #14 that requires ownership maintenance of trees in perpetuity.
- Reconsider the types of plants in the butterfly garden.

Committee Member Skorpanich made a motion to recommend approval of DRC No. 4959-18, Sunrise Senior Assisted Living & Memory Care to the Planning Commission based on the findings and conditions listed in the staff report with the following changes and additional conditions and suggestion as follows:

- Strike Condition #15 in its entirety.

- The last sentence in Community Development Condition #14 shall apply to all trees on site.
- The plants for the butterfly garden may be substituted with more appropriate species.
- The fencing, planters and potential safety conditions for the drive aisle, as well as the fencing along the park side of the property to be reconfigured.

Chair McDermott seconded this motion, but before a vote could be called, conditions of the motion were called to discussion for clarification. Chair McDermott then canceled the motion and Committee Member Skorpanich amended her motion to include the above points and the addition:

- The fencing, planters and potential safety conditions for the drive aisle, as well as the fencing along the park side of the property shall return to the Committee for further review prior to the issuance of a building permit.

SECOND: McDermott
AYES: McCormack, McDermott, and Imboden
NOES: Fox and Skorpanich
ABSENT: None
ABSTAIN: None

MOTION CARRIED.

RECESS: 7:44 - 7:54 p.m.

Committee Member McCormack was not feeling well and excused himself from the meeting at 8 p.m.

New Agenda Items

DRC No. 4962-18 - ALDI

- A proposal to convert an existing Staples retail store to an ALDI grocery store and two vacant tenant spaces, with minor site improvements.
- 2050 N. Tustin Street
- Staff Contact: Monique Schwartz, 714-744-7224, mschwartz@cityoforange.org
- DRC Action: Preliminary Review.

Monique Schwartz, Associate Planner, provided an overview of the proposal consistent with the staff report.

Chair McDermott opened the public comment portion of the meeting; there were no speakers.

Branko Prebanda, the project architect, provided a presentation of design intentions.

The Committee had questions and comments on the following:

- The project is successful in emulating the mall; however the design does not work in the existing shopping center context.
- The innovative architecture clashes with the design of the existing shopping center.
- The Committee would like to see an internally consistent integrated design theme. The applicant could maintain similar forms and change the materials, or maintain similar materials and change the form and still have a link to the existing design of the shopping center. The submittal plans show that both form and material are changing. It would be more acceptable if the building had a stepped roof instead of a shed roof to make an argument that the forms are tied.
- The percentage of graphics on the window area needs to fall within the sign standards.
- It would be difficult to make findings that the project has an integrated design and complements the existing center.
- The applicant may be able to use terra-cotta in a contemporary way.
- Mr. Branko stated that ALDI has an established brand and theme.

Chairman McDermott stated this is a preliminary review so no vote is needed.

Committee Member Skorpanich informed staff she will not be available for the April 17, 2019 meeting.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair McDermott adjourned the meeting at 8:33 p.m.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, April 3, 2019.