CITY OF ORANGE DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES – FINAL

December 16, 2009

Committee Members Present: Adrienne Gladson

Bill Cathcart Tim McCormack Craig Wheeler Joe Woollett

Committee Members Absent: None

Staff in Attendance: Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager

Sonal Thakur, Assistant Planner Sandi Dimick, Recording Secretary

Administrative Session – 5:00 P.M.

Chair McCormack opened the Administrative Session with a review of the Agenda.

Planning Manager, Leslie Aranda Roseberry, stated there was one item on the Agenda that would be moving forward; there were no changes. An email had been forwarded to all Committee Members regarding the conflict of interest time frame, specifically for Chair McCormack and the work his wife had done for Doug Ely. If it was over a year Chair McCormack could sit in on projects brought forward by Mr. Ely and that same time frame would work for all Committee Members. If there were any further questions regarding that issue, questions could be funneled through her or the City Attorney's office.

The Committee Members reviewed the minutes and noted corrections and changes.

There was no further discussion.

Committee Member Woollett made a motion to adjourn the Administrative Session.

SECOND: Craig Wheeler

AYES: Bill Cathcart, Adrienne Gladson, Tim McCormack, Craig Wheeler, Joe Woollett

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

MOTION CARRIED.

Administrative Session adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

Regular Session - 5:30 P.M.

ROLL CALL:

All DRC members were present.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION:

Opportunity for members of the public to address the Design Review Committee on matters not listed on the Agenda.

There was none.

CONSENT ITEMS:

All matters that are announced as Consent Items are considered to be routine by the Design Review Committee and will be enacted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of said items unless members of the Design Review Committee, staff, or the public request specific items to be removed from the Consent Items for separate action.

(1) APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

- (a) November 4, 2009
- (b) November 18, 2009
- (c) December 2, 2009

Committee Member Wheeler made a motion to approve the meeting minutes from November 4, 2009, November 18, 2009, and December 2, 2009, with the changes and corrections noted during the Administrative Session.

SECOND: Adrienne Gladson

AYES: Bill Cathcart, Tim McCormack, Adrienne Gladson, Craig Wheeler, Joe Woollett

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

MOTION CARRIED.

AGENDA ITEMS:

Continued Items: None

New Agenda Items:

(2) DRC No. 4456-09-PHAMPTON NEW RESIDENCE

- A proposal to construct a new single-family residence on a vacant lot.
- 6022 Jack Pine Street
- Staff Contact: Sonal Thakur, 714-744-7239, sthakur@cityoforange.org
- DRC ACTION: Final Determination

Assistant Planner, Sonal Thakur, presented a project overview consistent with the Staff Report.

Applicant, Sean Brennan, address on file, stated regarding the sectional garage doors they would be stained to have the appearance of wood. That treatment had been used in the past and if a pedestrian was to walk by they would not be able to tell the doors were not wood, and as far as wear and tear and maintenance the metal was a much better product. The doors would be stained and he could provide addresses of homes that they had done that resembled the stain treatment that would be used.

Applicant, Ryan White, address on file, stated as far as the stone was concerned there would be some pre-cast concrete around the arches that they used instead of using stone. The first lot that they had completed had a much different architecture and the project being presented was an Italian style and once stone was added it went more toward a Tuscan style.

Mr. Brennan stated the homes were custom homes and not tract homes. There was another lot that he would hopefully be presenting to the DRC in the near future.

Public Comment

None.

Chair McCormack opened the item for discussion by the Committee.

Committee Member Wheeler commented that the Staff Report stated that the proposed residence had not reflected a specific recognizable architectural style. He believed it was a very good example of an Italian Renaissance Villa and it was very well done. The rhythms were great, the arches were great, and it worked out very well. To him it was a very recognizable style and it was done well. He had a few questions. First of all he pointed to lines on the drawings and asked what they represented?

Mr. White stated the lines were a stucco detail that allowed for a different color band on the edge. It was shown on the color detail sheet.

Committee Member Wheeler asked what the material on the brackets would be?

Mr. White stated they would be using foam that resembled wood.

Committee Member Wheeler stated on the legend there was mention of a wood fascia on number 8, but he could not find that reference on the plans.

Mr. White pointed to that detail on the plans.

Committee Member Wheeler stated he liked the rhythm and loved the shutters. He was remembering, in Italian Renaissance and especially the Villas, the shutters were very important. As he had understood it, it was the area where the wealthy would escape to from Venice in the summer and they would party all night with the shutters open and close them during the day time to sleep. They were very nicely detailed shutters. Regarding an area he pointed to on the plans, there was a 20 40 window that might be in a shower and it was something he always tried to avoid. He suggested that the applicant rearrange the bathroom so the window could remain and not be in the shower. He also suggested that 2 part roof tile be used.

Chair McCormack asked the applicants if they were the architects or the property owners?

Mr. Brennan stated that Mr. White was the architect and he was the developer. The lot had been purchased by the Phampton's and the home had been designed as their dream home.

Chair McCormack stated he mirrored Committee Member Wheeler's comments and the proposed project was very well done. He liked what was being presented. His questions pertained to the site and he asked if there would be a barn or a development in the back?

Mr. Brennan stated there were thoughts of a tennis court, pool, and putting green with a couple of arbors and a feature, such as a gazebo, off of the tennis courts. They had not finalized that.

Mr. White stated there was a horse trail that ran along the back of the property.

Chair McCormack asked if they were reviewing any of that, or just the architecture?

Ms. Thakur stated those details had been reviewed when the first lot came forward; prior to permits being issued the trail had to be in place. They were currently just reviewing the house.

Committee Member Woollett stated he agreed with Committee Member Wheeler. He had no problem with the use of metal garage doors and they were an appropriate use; he preferred metal doors except in Old Towne.

Mr. White stated they would look just like wood. The doors would be painted with a faux finish and they would use metal hinges to give the door the appearance of wooden doors. He stated they had just completed one in Yorba Linda, an RV door that looked like wood, and the owner of the property was receiving calls asking where they had gotten the wooden doors.

Committee Member Woollett asked if there were vertical joints in the doors?

Mr. White stated the joints would be painted in.

Committee Member Woollett stated he had not cared for that, it was really phony. If it looked like a rough wood door and it was not wood, it was dishonest, but they did other things that were dishonest.

Mr. White stated the garage door would have a dimple in it that would be painted black and it would appear grooved.

Committee Member Wheeler stated he was opposed to the use of stone on the proposed project.

Mr. Brennan stated he agreed. The property owners were very adamant about not using stone as they wanted a particular flavor to their home. The owners had brought in books and pictures of what they wanted.

Ms. Thakur stated she was attempting to add more of the natural urban feel.

Committee Member Wheeler presented some pictures of Italian Villas.

Committee Member Woollett stated the proposed project ignored the Orange Park Acres guideline for ranch style, but none of the homes in that particular area were ranch style.

Chair McCormack stated architecture made the statement but landscape would also add to the project and he understood that was not being presented.

Committee Member Wheeler stated that at a previous meeting there had been a number of trees that were mentioned that should not be planted close to horse trails and he asked Chair McCormack if he wanted to provide that information to the applicants?

Mr. Brennan stated they had a specimen list that they had to follow from the CC&R's. There were guidelines for their developments that had been reviewed some time ago.

Committee Member Woollett stated fairly recently it had been brought to the Committee's attention that there were certain trees that were poisonous to horses.

Chair McCormack stated he had completed some research prior to a previous presentation and had come up with a list of trees. Hypericum was one of them.

Committee Member Gladson stated she felt the proposed project was a very nice custom house. She was relying on the architects regarding the consistency question and she had seen Tuscan and Italian influences and she was not certain if everything was consistent. Her favorite element was the treatment above the entry door that appeared to be some metal work. It seemed to her that it would be nice to have that element someplace else.

Mr. White stated that there was the arch over the entry that made the entry statement and to put the detail anywhere else it would take away from the entry statement. They had included some other details in the recessed corners of the windows.

Committee Member Gladson stated regarding the chimney spark arrester, she had not wanted it to appear rusty over time and she assumed it was all metal. She wondered if there was value in treating it like part of the ornamentation. In her experience, in 10 years spark arresters tended to stick out like a sore thumb.

Mr. Brennan stated it was a shroud. He placed shrouds on his homes; as a builder he wanted to have a trademark that people would recognize. The shrouds were one of his trademarks. If they were to look at homes in Orange Park Acres they could pick out his projects. He had just finished a home on Wildwood in Villa Park and it was very nice. He felt the Committee would be pleased with what they looked like and they would add a little tile too.

Committee Member Gladson stated regarding all of the accessory structures that might be part of the site, those items would not need to return to the DRC and those would be for Staff review.

Ms. Thakur stated that was correct; those items would be reviewed for compatibility and they would review the floor area ratio.

Chair McCormack stated he had the list of those poisonous plantings. Upon review of the applicant's plant palette he had found three that were poisonous to horses; the leaves and acorns of the Oak trees were poisonous. They had conditioned on a previous project that the trees could be used as long as they were kept away from horse areas. The Oaks were a predominant landscape tree.

Mr. Brennan stated there were Oak trees on the site; they abutted the property.

Chair McCormack stated if they were existing trees the DRC could not ask that they be taken out. Most equestrian owners knew that the leaves and acorns of the Oak tree were poisonous and they would deal with those issues. Prunus species and Hypericum were also poisonous species. There were also others, but those were the trees that were on the applicant's plant palette. The predominant character of the trees in Orange Park Acres were Pepper trees, Eucalyptus, Pines, and Platanus.

Committee Member Gladson stated she liked Sycamore trees.

Mr. Brennan stated they were planning on the use of Pepper and Olive trees. Sycamores were shallow-rooted and they would not hold up very well.

Chair McCormack stated for the Eucalyptus tree he would recommend Eucalyptus grandis. It was not as susceptible to the Bark beetle.

Committee Member Cathcart made a suggestion that for Chair McCormack and himself that they review the landscape plan; not that they would need to approve it, but he would want to see that.

Mr. Brennan stated that should be completed within two weeks. They would attempt, with the Committee's permission, to get the project to the Building Division and then get the landscape plans caught up.

Ms. Thakur stated City Hall would be closed December 24, 2009 to January 4, 2010. There was also a 15 day appeal period, and she imagined there would not be any opposition to the proposed project. She could not see an issue with the project being submitted to Building.

Mr. Brennan stated they would not submit the project until after January 4th.

Chair McCormack stated the DRC had not needed to approve a landscape plan, but it was more of a benefit to the applicant as there was not a professional landscape person at the City level available to do that.

Mr. Brennan stated they would take advantage of that and found that very helpful.

Committee Member Cathcart stated either he or Chair McCormack could review the landscape plans.

Mr. Brennan stated they would be completing the plans for lots 1 and 2, and hopefully they would have two sets of plans for review.

Committee Member Wheeler made a motion to approve DRC No. 4456-09, Phampton New Residence, subject to the conditions contained in the Staff Report and with the following changes:

- 1. Omit Condition No. 3 and allow that the garage doors be metal.
- 2. Omit Condition No. 4, eliminating the need for the stone requirement.

And with the following suggestions:

- 1. For the roof tile, use 2 part tile instead of S-tile.
- 2. A landscape plan shall be submitted for review.
- 3. Use suggested tree palette: Pepper, Eucalyptus grandis, Pine, and Platanus (Sycamore).

SECOND: Adrienne Gladson

AYES: Bill Cathcart, Adrienne Gladson, Tim McCormack, Craig Wheeler, Joe Woollett

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

MOTION CARRIED.

ADJOURNMENT:

Committee Member Gladson made a motion to adjourn to the next regular scheduled meeting on Wednesday, January 6, 2010, at 5:00 p.m.

SECOND: Craig Wheeler

AYES: Bill Cathcart, Adrienne Gladson, Craig Wheeler, Joe Woollett, Tim McCormack

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

MOTION CARRIED.