

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE: FEBRUARY 19, 2014

To: Chair Imboden and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Leslie Roseberry, Planning Manager

FROM: Lucy Yeager, Contract Planner

SUBJECT: DRC No. 4721-13 – Artwork and Signage for Chapman University Digital Media

Arts Center (DMAC) and Recreation Complex [Associated with Previously

Approved Filmmaker's Village] Parking Structure

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to have a new sign screening permanently fixed onto the entrance of the east parking structure façade on the Digital Media Arts Center and Recreation Complex (DMAC) parking structure (recently constructed) with interchangeable artwork featured. The request also includes a request for a wall-mounted parking structure sign and a free-standing car counter monument sign upon entrance into the site. Condition of Approval No. 45 for the Chapman University's Filmmaker's Village (MJSP No. 0671-11) and Condition of Approval No. 43 for the DMAC project (MJSP No. 0729-13) requires that signs shall be reviewed by the Planning Department and scheduled before the Design Review Committee for consideration and recommendation.

RECOMMENDED ACTION - RECOMMEND APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS TO COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Staff recommends the DRC recommend approval of the proposed project with conditions to the Community Development Director who has final consideration of the project.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Chapman University

Property Location: On the Chapman University Campus, DMAC parking

structure bounded by the Atchison Topeka & Santa Fe (AT & SF) Railroad Tracks and Maple Avenue. Entrance into the parking structure is off of N. Cypress Street on the east [addresses 401 E. Maple and 230 N. Cypress St.] Property

resides within the Old Towne District.

General Plan Designation: PFI (Public Facilities (Max 0.5 FAR) and Institution (Max

2.0 FAR)

Zoning Classification: P-I (SP) (Public Institution, Chapman University Specific

Plan)

Existing Development: Recently constructed parking structure. Former Anaconda

Wire & Cable Company Complex

Property Size: DMAC project site is 3.5-acres

Associated Applications: None
Previous DRC Project Review: None

Previous Associated City Approvals: DMAC - MNSP No. 0729-13, VAR No. 2226-13

(Setback and fence height), AA No. 0206-13, and, DRC No. 4676-13; Filmmaker's Village – VAR No. 2209-11,

MJSP No. 0671-11, and, DRC No. 4565-11

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice is required relative to DRC for this project. A Public Notice of Determination will be provided following the Community Development Director's decision.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The overall project (Filmmaker's Village/DMAC) is fully and adequately addressed in the previously approved certified Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) No. 1717-03 prepared for the Chapman University Specific Plan Amendment No. 5. Said FEIR was prepared in accordance with the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15070 et seq and in conformance with the Local CEQA Guidelines.

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State Guidelines 15311 (Class 11, Accessory Structures) because the project involves onsite signage. There is no public review required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

This proposed project is to have a new sign screening permanently fixed onto the entrance of the east parking structure façade on the Digital Media Arts Center and Recreation Complex (DMAC) parking structure (recently constructed) with interchangeable artwork featured. It is understood that the artwork placed within this sign screening will be changed out based on events, movies or other programs at the Digital Media Arts Center or at the Dodge College of Film and Media Arts. The artwork is anticipated to be changed out every 2 to 12 months. The request also includes a request for a wall-mounted parking structure sign and a free-standing car counter monument sign upon entrance into the site.

The proposed project falls within the Academic 2 planning area of the Chapman University Specific Plan, which allows athletic fields and facilities, athletic events, classrooms, and other support uses.

Attachment No. 1 provides site plan, elevations, and details for the proposed project. Attachment No. 2 provides renderings from the approved project for reference.

EXISTING SITE

The existing site is located within the limits of the City's Old Towne Orange District. It previously was a portion of the Anaconda Wire & Cable Company Complex. The parking structure has recently been completed and is in operation.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

North of the parking structure is also a portion of the DMAC project – basketball and volleyball courts as well as tennis courts. To the east across Cypress Street is Chapman University's Marion Knott Studios. To the south is the Chapman University Judith Partridge Dance Center. To the east and south are a few single family homes. To the south of the project and on the west side of Atchison Street is the Orange Transportation Center, which provides Metrolink and Amtrak commuter rail services, as well as OCTA bus services. And, then, to the west is the City of Orange Santa Fe Depot Public Parking Lot across the railroad tracks.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.

- a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
- b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.

2. Landscape.

- a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
- b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
- c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
- 3. **Signage**. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.

4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner, which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

<u>Issue 1 Parking Structure Sign Screen Element with Artwork:</u>

Chapman University is proposing artwork integrated into the building of the parking structure. Relative to facilitating the artwork over the parking structure entry (on the east façade), it will consist of a permanently fixed sign screening element integrated into the parking structure that is approximately 12 feet wide by 21 feet in height (already built into the structure). The element extends approximately 16 inches above the top of the parking structure façade. The artwork is constructed of weather-resistant materials, changed out periodically and the element will utilize external lighting for lighting at night. The applicant indicates that it will be changed out approximately every 2 to 12 months and is anticipated that the artwork will highlight Chapman University special events, motion pictures, or decorative designs. It will also serve as a screening device, minimizing the visual impact of the parking structure from vehicles entering the parking structure. The artwork will be visible from internal to the campus as it is setback 114 feet from N. Cypress Street and faces Marion Knott Studios. It is believed that the artwork will not be visible from any residential dwellings or from off campus locations.

The proposed artwork is being suggested as part of Chapman University's Art-in-Public-Places program, an allowed provision as noted in the adopted Chapman University Specific Plan (Amendment No. 6). Said program is designed to enhance the physical environment of the Chapman University campus and the surrounding community.

The goals of the program, as described in the Specific Plan, are as follows:

- To add to the cultural heritage of Chapman University and the City of Orange through aesthetic enhancement of the campus and the surrounding community.
- To make durable art of excellent quality available to students, faculty and the community-a-large to stimulate intellectual and artistic growth.
- To create focal points within the campus for the enjoyment and contemplation of fine art.
- To enhance the stature of Chapman University and the City of Orange by defining its commitment to artists and to the creative process as a vital element of urban dynamics.

The Specific Plan includes the following guidelines for Art-in Public Places:

- At its options, the University may elect to commission artists to create works to be integrated into the buildings, plazas, garden rooms, quads and malls on campus.
- All artwork used in exterior areas shall be constructed of durable all-weather materials including, but not limited to, glass, metal, paint, wood, stone, brick and other similar materials.
- The art may be created using a variety of mediums and techniques...murals...and other items of a unique and high quality nature that embody artistic elements.

- Each piece or art shall be designed to enhance or complement the outdoor area or building to which it relates.
- The University shall have the right to choose all art on campus, although the University shall go through Design Review prior to installing any art on the outside of or surrounding any building campus.
- Art is encouraged to face public rights-of-way and streets to help beautify the community and make art accessible to everyone. Art may be placed in the front setback areas along the streets.
- Art shall relate to the context of the surrounding area, and/or to the architecture and use of the closest building.

The applicant suggests that the proposed artwork on the parking structure is consistent with the above Specific Plan guidelines.

The applicant has proposed the following conditions of approval be included relative to this integrated artwork. Such have been included in the recommended Conditions of Approval for the project.

- 1. The artwork shall not advertise special events, with the exception of special events occurring at the Digital Media Arts Center or at the Dodge College of Film and Media Arts. In no case shall the artwork advertise special events for more than 150 days in a calendar year.
- 2. The artwork may include "Chapman University," Chapman University's logo and/or any school, business, building or function name that is owned, operated, and/or leased by Chapman University provided that such information may not exceed 40 percent of the total artwork size.
- 3. Once a building permit has been issued and finalized for the original installation of the integrated artwork, future building permits and/or Planning Division approval shall not be required from the City of Orange to change out the artwork panel, provided the artwork panel does not exceed 12 feet in width and 21 feet in height. Should the panel exceed either dimension, the panel shall be reviewed by the Director of Community Development, or his/her designee, to determine if building permits and/or Planning Division approval is necessary.
- 4. The artwork shall not include paper, styrofoam, cardboard materials or any lighting affixed to the artwork (including an electronic LED display).
- 5. The artwork shall be externally lighted. Flashing, blinking and colored lighting shall not be permitted on the artwork. LED lighting and other types of external lighting are permitted.
- 6. The artwork shall be maintained in good condition and not contain any torn material.

Issue 2 Wall-Mounted Parking Structure Sign

As part of this project request, the applicant is proposing a wall-mounted parking sign entering the parking structure that is a standard parking structure entry sign with clearance, maximum weight and exit/do not enter indicators. The wall-mounted parking entry sign is considered an "Internal Sign" under Section 5.7.3 of the Chapman University Specific Plan. This sign is 28 inches tall and 17 feet long for a total surface area of approximately 40 square feet. The main copy will consist of the word "Parking" and is approximately 16 inches tall (plus roughly 2 inches above the dark slate background) and approximately 11 feet long for a total copy area of 14.67 square feet. The façade where the sign will be located is 95 feet, 10 inches in length. The entire east elevation of the parking structure is 222 feet, 6 inches in length. The copy of the proposed sign is brushed aluminum in color and is in front of an internally-illuminated cabinet painted in "dark slate". The lower portion of the sign is black with white vinyl lettering. The font of the sign is Futura Medium.

<u>Issue 3 – Free-Standing Car Counter Monument Sign</u>

The free-standing car counter monument sign is considered a "University Directional Sign", as described by Section 5.7.2 of the Chapman University Specific Plan. Consistent with Section 5.7.2.A.5 of the Chapman University Specific Plan, the double-sided monument sign is 6 feet, 6 inches tall and 2 feet, 11.25 inches wide for a total surface area of 19.1 square feet. The monument sign is set back approximately 6 inches from the N. Cypress Street right-of-way and located approximately 17 feet, 6 inches from the intersection of the private access drive and N. Cypress Street right-of-way.

The monument sign contains a digital display, indicating the available parking space information for the DMAC parking structure, as well as the Barrera and Lastinger parking structures. The University feels this information will significantly minimize the time it takes for a student, faculty or staff member to search for a parking space. The monument sign has a white background and a black scroll topper.

Of note, the University has two other parking structures (Lastinger and Barrera) with car count monuments already approved and operational. They only reference the parking structure it is located at rather than all three. Relative to the design, it is similar to monument signage located at 544 N. Cypress Street and 630 W. Palm Avenue. In essence, the University is incorporating the two sign types into one design. The University has expressed that they anticipate redoing the current car counter signs at Barrera and Lastinger parking structures with this new design in the future.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

Planning Staff reviewed the project on January 28, 2014 and deemed the application complete as well on January 28, 2014 and, to be presented to the Design Review Committee with conditions. The Traffic Division of the Public Works Department also reviewed the project and deemed it acceptable.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

- 1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).
- The proposed project incorporates the University's approved Specific Plan's development standards and design guidelines relative to Art-in-Public Places and Signage.
- The applicant has proposed self imposed conditions of approval regarding the artwork.
- 2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).
- The subject property is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and the California Register of Historical Resources as a contributing resource to the Old Towne Orange Historic District, and is also a contributor to the City of Orange's locally designated Old Towne District. The previously approved project Filmmaker's Village and then DMAC, was designed to comply with the Secretary of Interior's standards and guidelines for historic properties.
- 3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).
- The proposed project incorporates and is consistent with the University's approved Specific Plan's development standards and design guidelines relative to Art-in-Public Places and Signage.
- The applicant has proposed self imposed conditions of approval regarding the artwork.
- The car count monument sign is similar to other car count signs at other University
 parking structures with a monument similar to two other monument signs on campus
 nearby.
- The signage and artwork affixed to the parking structure is considered internal signage.

- 4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).
- The project site is not an infill residential development; therefore this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The recommendation of approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Relative to the artwork on the parking structure:
 - a. The artwork shall not advertise special events, with the exception of special events occurring at the Digital Media Arts Center or at the Dodge College of Film and Media Arts. In no case shall the artwork advertise special events for more than 150 days in a calendar year.
 - b. The artwork may include "Chapman University," Chapman University's logo and/or any school, business, building or function name that is owned, operated, and/or leased by Chapman University provided that such information may not exceed 40 percent of the total artwork size.
 - c. Once a building permit has been issued and finalized for the original installation of the integrated artwork, future building permits and/or Planning Division approval shall not be required from the City of Orange to change out the artwork panel, provided the artwork panel does not exceed 12 feet in width and 21 feet in height. Should the panel exceed either dimension, the panel shall be reviewed by the Director of Community Development, or his/her designee, to determine if building permits and/or Planning Division approval is necessary.
 - d. The artwork shall not include paper, styrofoam, cardboard materials or any lighting affixed to the artwork (including an electronic LED display).
 - e. The artwork shall be externally lighted. Flashing, blinking and colored lighting shall not be permitted on the artwork. LED lighting and other types of external lighting are permitted.
 - f. The artwork shall be maintained in good condition and not contain any torn material.
 - g. The artwork shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials, and lighting.
 - h. No advertising will be allowed on the artwork outside of that detailed in this discretionary permit. The artwork imagery or graphics shall not advertise a product, business, corporate, or organizational logo or text, except as that noted in 1.b. above. The artwork should make a positive visual contribution to the overall image of the City.
- 2. Within 7 business days of discretionary project approval provide three sets of "final" updated plans and exhibits resulting from all adjustments to plans and exhibits from the

- responses to the DRC meeting on February 19, 2014 and any directives for approval from the Community Development Director or his/her designee regarding final decision.
- 3. The approved Conditions of Approval be implemented, complied with per each condition's assigned time frame for implementation and reported to the responsible monitoring agency.

The following code provisions are applicable to this project, and are included for information only. This is not a complete list of requirements, and other code provisions may apply to the project.

- 4. All construction shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with plans and exhibits labeled Attachments 1 and 2 in the staff report (dated February 19, 2014, date stamped January 14, 2014 with any approved amendments resulting from said meeting and reflected in meeting date February 19, 2014 staff report and Attachments 1 and 2, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Community Development Director.
- 5. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
- 6. The applicant shall comply with all Federal, State and local laws, including all City regulations. Violation of any of those laws in connection with the use will be cause for revocation of this permit.
- 7. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plot plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public hearing.
- 8. Prior to the issuance of building permits, the applicant shall pay all applicable development fees including but not limited to: City sewer connection, Orange County Sanitation District Connection Fee, Transportation System Improvement Program, Fire Facility, Police Facility, Park Acquisition, Sanitation District, and School District, as required.
- 9. Construction permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division and Public Works Grading Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.

- 10. Applicant/developer shall be aware that all work within the public right-of-way requires the issuance of an Encroachment Permit. Such work includes, but is not limited to, work on the sidewalk, driveway construction, and utility laterals.
- 11. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first pages of the plan and sign documents when submitting to the Building Department for the plan check and sign permit process.
- 12. If not utilized, project approval expires twenty-four months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060. The Planning entitlements expire unless Building Permits are pulled within 2 years of the original approval.

ATTACHMENTS

- 1. Project Site Plan, Parking Structure Entry and Details, Proposed Monument Sign Site Plan Location Detail and Monument Sign Details dated January 14, 2014.
- 2. Previously approved project renderings for reference.

cc: Kris Olsen, Chapman University One University Drive Orange, CA 92866

Mark Hickner, KTGY Group 17922 Fitch Irvine, CA 92614

File