



Planning Commission Agenda Item

September 16, 2013

TO: Chair Steiner and
Members of the Planning Commission

THRU: Leslie Aranda Roseberry
Planning Manager

FROM: Anna Pehoushek, Principal Planner

SUBJECT

PUBLIC HEARING: Variance No. 2229-13 and Design Review No. 4669-13; a request to construct a 2-story, 21'4" freestanding elevator tower to address access requirements for an existing medical office building in the Old Towne Orange Historic District.

SUMMARY

The proposed project involves modifications to the rear of a fire damaged 2-story medical office building. Alterations include removal and replacement of an existing outdoor stairway and balcony and construction of a 2-story freestanding elevator tower to achieve accessibility requirements for the second story of the building.

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Adopt Planning Commission Resolution No. 30-13 entitled:

**A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION
APPROVING VARIANCE NO. 2229-13 AND DESIGN
REVIEW NO. 4669-13 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A 2-
STORY, 21'4" FREESTANDING ELEVATOR TOWER TO
ADDRESS ACCESS REQUIREMENTS FOR AN EXISTING
MEDICAL OFFICE BUILDING LOCATED AT 615 EAST
CHAPMAN AVENUE**

AUTHORIZATION/GUIDELINES

The Planning Commission is authorized to review and take action on the following Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Sections:

§ 17.10.040 Review and take action on Variances requests.

§ 17.10.070 Review and take action on development projects within the Old Towne Orange Historic District.

PUBLIC NOTICE

On September 5, 2013, the City sent Public Hearing Notices to a total of 118 property owners/tenants within a 300-foot radius of the project site, and persons specifically requesting notice. The project site was posted with the notification on September 5, 2013.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 (Class 1 – Existing Facilities) as the project involves rehabilitation of a damaged structure and the installation of an elevator to meet current ADA standards.

PROJECT BACKGROUND

<i>Applicant/ Property Owner :</i>	Dr. Gerald Eidenmuller
<i>Property Location:</i>	615 East Chapman Avenue, Old Towne Historic District
<i>Existing General Plan Land Use Element designation:</i>	Old Towne Mixed Use-15 Spoke Street (0.6 FAR; 6-15 DU/Acre)
<i>Existing Zoning Classification:</i>	Old Towne Mixed Use-15 Spoke Street (OTMU-15S)
<i>Old Towne:</i>	Yes
<i>Redevelopment Project Area:</i>	N/A
<i>Specific Plan/PC:</i>	N/A
<i>Site Size:</i>	8,771 Sq. ft.
<i>Circulation:</i>	Chapman Avenue is a Primary Arterial with an ultimate ROW of 100 feet
<i>Existing conditions:</i>	Contributing medical office building (adaptively reused historic residential structure)
<i>Surrounding land uses and Zoning:</i>	Single family residences (north) and professional office (south, east and west) Single-Family Residential (R-1-6) (north) and Old Towne Mixed Use-15 Spoke Street (OTMU-15S) (south, east and west)
<i>Previous Applications/Entitlements:</i>	None

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project site is developed with a 2-story (29’8” high), contributing c. 1914 Craftsman residential building that was adapted for use as a medical office building in the 1970s. Portions of the building interior were damaged by a fire in late 2011. Interior alterations include repair of fire damaged areas as well as floor plan modifications to better accommodate present-day needs of medical office tenants.

The proposed modifications to the historic 2,628 sq. ft. building include the addition of a 2-story elevator tower to meet Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements. This tower would be constructed 5’ north of the northeast corner of the existing structure on a portion of the lot that is presently occupied by a storage shed, screen wall and hardscape features. The existing exterior stairway, balcony and wood railing would be removed and reconstructed to be integrated with the elevator tower. The reconstruction has been designed in a manner which exposes almost the entire north elevation of the historic structure, including portions which have been obstructed from view by the existing contemporary exterior stairway and balcony.

In addition to the elevator tower, the proposed project also includes a 107 sq. ft. addition to the first floor to accommodate a radiology room (59 sq. ft.) and expanded operator (48 sq. ft.). A 37 sq. ft. expansion of the second floor entry area on the north elevation (rear) of the building is proposed in conjunction with the elevator tower and reconstructed balcony/walkway. An ADA access ramp is also proposed at the ground level leading from the parking lot to the building entrance.

The proposed building modifications and elevator tower are located at the rear of the subject property. The elevator tower would be visible from Chapman Avenue over the roofline/rooftop deck and to the east of the single-story brick wing of the first floor (east end of building). It would also be visible at an angle from the intersection of the alley running behind the building with Cleveland and Harwood Streets. The tower will not be visible to east- and westbound traffic on Chapman Avenue given its position behind the historic structure and next to a taller architectural element and roof form on the adjacent property to the east.

Development Standards

	Required	Proposed	Code Section
<i>Building Height</i>	2 stories or 30’, or the height of adjacent buildings, whichever is less. (Existing adjacent buildings: 1 story)	2 stories (29’8” high)	OMC 17.17.060 Old Towne Design Standards
<i>Distance between structures</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>Fence height</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>Floor Area Ratio (FAR)</i>	0.6 FAR Max. (Existing: 0.32 FAR)	.34 FAR	OMC 17.19.120

<i>Lot size (residential)</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>Lot frontage</i>	50 feet (Existing: 67.46 feet)	No Change	OMC 17.19.120
<i>Lot depth</i>	N/A (130 feet Existing)	No Change	N/A
<i>Open space, private (residential)</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>South or Front Setback</i>	15 feet	No Change	OMC 17.19.120
<i>North or Rear Setback</i>	10' for proposed building exceeds 1 story or 20' in height	70'	OMC 17.19.120
<i>West or Side Setback</i>	5-Feet	No Change	OMC 17.19.120
<i>East or Side Setback</i>	5-Feet	5-feet	OMC 17.19.120
<i>Parking (medical office)</i>	5 spaces/1,000 sq. ft. (Existing: 13 spaces)	No Change	OMC 17.34.060

REQUIRED FINDINGS

Variance: The applicant is requesting a Variance from Orange Municipal Code Section 17.17.060 and the development standards presented in the Old Towne Design Standards to allow a 2-story structure to be built where the height of adjacent buildings are 1-story.

Required Findings:

1. Because of special circumstances applicable to subject property, including size, shape, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of the zoning ordinance is found to deprive the subject property of privileges enjoyed by other properties in the vicinity and under identical zone classification.
2. The Variance granted shall be subject to such conditions which will assure that the authorized adjustment shall not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which subject property is located.

Design Review: The applicant is requesting Design Review to ensure that the proposed elevator tower and building additions meet adopted criteria and standards for the Old Towne Historic District.

Required Findings:

1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the Design Review Committee or other reviewing body for the project.

2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2 and OTDS).
3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards and their required findings.
4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character.

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1 – Elevator Tower Height:

The proposed project addresses the applicant's need to comply with the accessibility requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). The applicant explored options for meeting the ADA requirement, including integrating an elevator in the envelope of the historic structure and constructing an exterior elevator. Based on the impact an interior elevator would have created on the floor plan of the medical office space, and particularly the manner that space could function for present-day medical office needs, the exterior elevator tower was selected as the preferred option.

In order to provide access to the second floor of the existing historic building, the elevator tower itself must be 2-stories in height. The Old Towne Design Standards limit the height of new construction on the Spoke Streets to 2 stories, unless the height of adjacent buildings is 1-story. Where adjacent buildings are 1-story, new construction may not exceed the height of that adjacent building. While the project site itself is developed with a 2-story historic structure, the height of the adjacent building that appears to be built on the property line 5' to the east is 1-story.

Resolution:

The provision of ADA access to the second floor is both an ADA and Building Code requirement. Although the proposed elevator tower is 2-stories in height, the Design Review Committee concluded that its design meets the standards set forth in the Old Towne Design Standards and the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Issue 2 – Architectural Design of Tower and Building Additions

A detailed presentation of the project design and Design Review Committee feedback is provided in Attachments 3 through 6 of this report.

Elevator Tower:

The proposed elevator tower and building additions are differentiated from the historic structure through the use of 6" horizontal wood siding to contrast, but be harmonious with, the shingle and brick exterior of the primary structure. The tower and associated stairway and balcony/walkway have been designed to allow for greater exposure of the historic north building elevation from the alley and properties to the north than presently exists. Additionally, the design of the elevator tower roof responds to the angles of the historic structure's roof and the roof form of the brick building element at the east side of the ground floor.

Building Additions:

The building additions proposed on the north elevation occur at both the first and second floors. These additions would have an exterior finish of horizontal wood siding similar to the elevator tower as a means of differentiating the historic building from the addition.

Modifications associated with the building additions include rehabilitation and reuse of existing historic windows, re-establishment of a historic doorway, and the use of new wood doors of a period appropriate style. A shed roof element would be added to the rear elevation over the CT Scan area in conjunction with the first floor building additions. The pitch of the roof would be similar to the pitch of the historic structure, and echoes the shed roof element of the entrance to the building on the south elevation (facing Chapman Avenue). The pitch of the new roof warranted slight adjustment in order to avoid impacts to the historic windows immediately above the point where the roof meets the wall.

Resolution:

Elevator Tower:

Consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards and Old Towne Design Standards, both the design and siting of the tower function to make it subordinate to the primary historic structure. Given the utilitarian nature of the elevator tower, and high level of integrity of the primary structure, staff believes that the proposed physical separation of the elevator tower from the historic structure and its design are appropriate and consistent with both the Old Towne Design Standards and Secretary of Interior Standards.

The simple form of the elevator tower does not detract from the character defining features of the historic structure. The use of horizontal wood siding in contrast to the shingled exterior of the primary structure functions to differentiate the old from the new. The tower's position on the site, and transparent balcony railing allow for greater exposure of the north elevation and character defining features of the structure. Although the railing design incorporates glass panels, the simple, open design of the wood vertical and horizontal members, again, differentiate the old from the new and allow for a clear view of nearly the entire north elevation.

Building Additions:

As with the elevator tower, the proposed building additions have been designed in a manner that is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards and Old Towne Design Standards. The additions are differentiated from the original historic structure, but are compatible with its character defining features. The window and door placement in the additions largely maintains the original building fenestration. Where new openings are being created, this is being done in a fashion that responds to the scale and rhythm of historic façade elements, and utilizes existing historic windows or new windows and doors compatible with the historic architecture.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

Staff Review Committee:

The proposed project does not involve changes to the site that meet City criteria for review by the Staff Review Committee.

Design Review Committee:

The Design Review Committee reviewed the project on July 3 and August 21, 2013. On August 21st the Design Review Committee recommended approval of the project to the Planning Commission subject to conditions of approval.

ATTACHMENTS/EXHIBITS

Attachments to Report:

1. Planning Commission Resolution No. 30-13
2. Vicinity Map
3. Design Review Committee Minutes, August 21, 2013
4. Design Review Committee Staff Report, August 21, 2013
5. Design Review Committee Minutes, July 3, 2013
6. Design Review Committee Staff Report, July 3, 2013

Exhibits provided to the Planning Commission:

- A. Submitted Half-size Plans stamp dated September 5, 2013

c: Doug Ely
DSE Architecture
145 S. Olive Street
Orange, CA 92866

Dr. Gerald Eidenmuller
10641 Rockhurst
Cowan Heights, CA 92705