



# *Planning Commission*

## Agenda Item

September 16, 2013

**TO:** Chair Steiner and  
Members of the Planning Commission

**THRU:** Leslie Aranda Roseberry  
Planning Manager

**FROM:** Marissa Moshier  
Historic Preservation Planner

### **SUBJECT**

**COMMISSION BUSINESS:** Design Review Committee No. 4685-13 and Minor Site Plan No. 0705-12 - Palm Avenue Housing, 730 W. Palm Avenue

### **SUMMARY**

The applicant proposes to relocate and reconstruct an existing barn and construct an addition; to construct a new detached two-car garage; and to construct a new 1 ½ story additional housing unit with attached garage on a parcel that contains a one-story single family residence. The single family residence is a contributor to the local Old Towne historic district. The barn is considered a non-contributor to the historic district. The applicant proposes to take access to the new housing units from a new driveway at the southwest corner of the property at N. Clark Street.

This item was originally heard for preliminary review and comment at the May 1, 2013 Design Review Committee meeting. Subsequent to the hearing, staff learned of several irregularities surrounding the processing of the project, one of which may have caused a Committee member to have a conflict of interest. To address all due process considerations and ensure that there were no procedural defects created by DRC's final review and recommendation, staff is directing the item to Planning Commission for final determination.

### **RECOMMENDED ACTION**

Adopt Planning Commission Resolution No. 31-13 entitled:

**A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ORANGE APPROVING MINOR SITE PLAN NO. 0705-12 AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE NO. 4685-13, FOR RELOCATING AND RECONSTRUCTING A NON-CONTRIBUTING BARN AS AN**

**ACCESSORY HOUSING UNIT, CONSTRUCTING A TWO CAR GARAGE, AND CONSTRUCTING ONE ADDITIONAL HOUSING UNIT ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 730 WEST PALM AVENUE**

**AUTHORIZATION/GUIDELINES**

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Sections 17.08.020 and 17.10.070 authorize the Planning Commission to review and take action on OMC Sections 17.14.250, 17.17.060 and 17.10.090 for review of demolition of any structure over 120 square feet in the Old Towne historic district and for review of project conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne Orange (Design Standards).

**PUBLIC NOTICE**

This Design Review Committee project does not require public noticing.

**ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

**Categorical Exemption:** The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Sections 15302 (Class 2 – Replacement or Reconstruction) and 15303 (Class 3 – New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures). There is no public review required.

**PROJECT BACKGROUND**

<i>Applicant:</i>	Rick Fox
<i>Property Owner:</i>	GCA Landholdings, LLC
<i>Property Location:</i>	730 W Palm Avenue
<i>Existing General Plan Land Use Element designation:</i>	Medium Density Residential (6 to 15 Du/Ac)
<i>Existing Zoning Classification:</i>	R-2-6 (Duplex Residential District)
<i>Old Towne:</i>	Yes
<i>Specific Plan/PC:</i>	N/A
<i>Site Size:</i>	0.13 Acre (14,182 sq. ft.)
<i>Circulation:</i>	W. Palm Avenue is a collector street. N. Clark Street is a local street
<i>Existing conditions:</i>	1,681 sq. ft. single-family residence (contributor to local Old Towne historic district) and 424 sq. ft. barn
<i>Surrounding land uses and Zoning:</i>	R-2-6 to east, west, and south; R-1-6 to north
<i>Previous Applications/Entitlements:</i>	None

## PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The 14,182 square foot property is developed with a one-story, single-family residence and detached barn. The 1,681 square foot residence was constructed in 1914 and is a contributor to the local Old Towne historic district. The building has been recently rehabilitated in conformance with the Historic Preservation Design Standards for Old Towne Orange (Design Standards). The 424 square foot detached barn structure is located at the rear of the property and is in poor condition with structural deficiencies. Because the barn was not previously identified in historic resources surveys of the local Old Towne historic district, staff requested that the applicant prepare a historic resource assessment of the barn. The historic resource assessment was prepared by an architectural historian meeting the *Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards* from Cynthia Ward Historic Preservation Consultants. The consultant's historic resource assessment found the barn to be a non-contributor to the local Old Towne historic district, because it lacks sufficient integrity to convey its significance as an early agriculture-related resource. The DRC staff report dated May 1, 2013 concurs with the consultant's findings that the barn is a non-contributor.

On May 1, 2013, two proposals for development of the property were presented to DRC for preliminary comments. Proposal A consisted of demolition of the barn, construction of a 1 ½ story duplex at the rear of the property, and construction of a two car garage to serve the existing residence. Proposal B consisted of relocation and reconstruction of the barn with a small addition to serve as an accessory housing unit, construction of a 1 ½ story single housing unit at the rear of the property, and construction of a two car garage to serve the existing residence. DRC preliminary comments recommended Proposal B, relocation and reconstruction of the barn. Based on these comments, the applicant chose to pursue Proposal B and submitted a Land Use Project Application for the project described below.

The applicant proposes relocation and reconstruction of the barn to the northwest of its existing location. A new 26 square foot addition will be constructed at the south elevation of the barn to bring the size to the required minimum 450 square feet for an accessory housing unit. A new 1,899 square foot, 1 ½ story building with one housing unit will be constructed at the rear southeast corner of the parcel. A new 604 square foot, two-car garage will be constructed to the east of the existing residence. Access to the reconstructed barn and new housing unit will be provided through a new driveway onto N. Clark Street, a cul-de-sac at the southwest corner of the property.

The property is located on the south side of W. Palm Avenue, east of N. Batavia St in the northwest quadrant of the local Old Towne historic district, outside of the National Register historic district. The property has three adjacent residential lots with two non-contributing buildings (constructed in 1956 and 1979) and one contributing building constructed in 1920. The south side of the 700-800 block of W. Palm Avenue contains a mixture of non-contributing one- and two-story multi-family apartments with two contributing residential properties. The lots on the south side range in size from 7,157, to 26,136 square feet in area. The north side of W. Palm Avenue has one contributing single-family residence surrounded by non-contributing single-family residences. The Floor Area Ratio (FAR) for the block ranges from .14 FAR to .34 FAR, with an average FAR of .21.

***Development Standards***

	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Code Section</b>
<i>Building Height</i>	1 ½ stories allowed in R-2 zones in Old Towne historic district, provided height is compatible with surrounding resources	1 ½ stories	OMC 17.17.060
<i>Distance between structures</i>	Between principal structures: 15'-0" minimum Between principal structure and accessory structure: 6'-0" minimum	26'-11" between existing residence and new housing unit 25'-8" between existing residence and barn	OMC 17.14.120
<i>Fence height</i>	6'-0" maximum outside of front yard setback	5'-0" outside of front yard setback	OMC 17.14.180
<i>Floor Area Ratio (FAR)</i>	0.70 FAR (existing) 0.15 FAR)	0.33 FAR	OMC 17.14.070
<i>Lot size (residential)</i>	No change	No change	No change
<i>Lot frontage</i>	No change	No change	No change
<i>Lot depth</i>	No change	No change	No change
<i>Open space, common (residential)</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>Open space, private (residential)</i>	350 sq. ft./unit	2,050 sq. ft.	OMC 17.14.070
<i>Open space, useable (residential)</i>	350 sq. ft./unit	2,050 sq. ft.	OMC 17.14.070
<i>Parking (residential)</i>	2 spaces per unit, at least 1 of which is enclosed, plus 1 additional space for accessory unit	4 enclosed and 2 unenclosed spaces	OMC 17.34.060.A
<i>Parking, guest (residential)</i>	N/A	N/A	N/A
<i>Setback, Front</i>	20'-0"	31'-10" for new garage	OMC 17.14.070

<i>Setback, Rear</i>	10'-0"	11'-0"	OMC 17.14.070
<i>Setback, Side East</i>	5'-0"	5'-0"	OMC 17.14.070
<i>Setback, Side West</i>	5'-0"	5'-0"	OMC 17.14.070

<b>APPLICATION(S) REQUESTED/ REQUIRED FINDINGS</b>
--

**Minor Site Plan:** The applicant is requesting approval of a Minor Site Plan to relocate, reconstruct and add to a non-contributing barn as an accessory housing unit, to construct a two car garage, and to construct one additional housing unit.

*Required Findings:*

1. The project design is compatible with surrounding development and neighborhoods.
2. The project conforms to City development standards and any applicable special design guidelines or specific plan requirements.
3. The project provides for safe and adequate vehicular and pedestrian circulation, both on- and off-site.
4. City services are available and adequate to serve the project.
5. The project has been designed to fully mitigate or substantially minimize adverse environmental effects.

**Design Review Committee:** The applicant is requesting approval of a Design Review Committee application to relocate, reconstruct and add to a non-contributing barn as an accessory housing unit, to construct a two car garage, and to construct one additional housing unit.

*Required Findings:*

1. In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the Design Review Committee or other reviewing body for the project.
2. In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines.
3. The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards and their required findings.
4. For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange infill residential design guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character.

## **ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES**

### Issue 1 - Relocation and Reconstruction of Barn:

To assess the existing condition of the barn and the feasibility of relocation, the applicant engaged a structural engineer, Grimm & Chen Structural Engineering, Inc. Based on the structural engineer's report and on-site observations from staff, the barn appears to lack an internal structural framing system that would allow it to be braced and relocated in one piece. Vertical board siding appears to serve as a vertical load bearing element. Additional structural support appears to be provided by plywood sheathing applied to the interior face of the vertical board siding in various locations. An interior stud wall, not original to the structure, appears to provide additional vertical and lateral support. The existing roof framing appears to have been modified several times in the past, resulting in substantial sagging of the roof ridge. The existing rafters and ridge are supported by 2x4 vertical members, not original to the structure, resting on existing ceiling planks. Plywood sheathing has also been added to strengthen the roof framing. A lack of waterproofing has contributed to deterioration of building elements used for structural support, including the vertical board siding and roof framing. Given the lack of internal structural framing and the deterioration of existing building elements, staff concurs with the applicant's structural engineer that relocation of the barn in one piece is unlikely to be feasible and that substantial reconstruction of the barn will likely be necessary to convert it to habitable space. Retaining the barn in its existing condition and location will result in continued deterioration.

The applicant proposes a three phase process for relocating and reconstructing the barn. In Phase 1, a new structure, including concrete slab with curb, waterproofing, and roof structure, will be constructed and prepared to receive the barn wall panels. In Phase 2, the barn will be prepared for relocation by replacing deteriorated vertical wood boards as necessary, removing and storing the existing rolling door and track, bracing the exterior walls, installing temporary collar ties at existing top plates, and removing the existing roof structure and cladding. In Phase 3, each of the four wall surfaces will be detached as panels, moved intact, and attached to the new structure. Please see Attachment 4: Barn Relocation Method for a more detailed description of the relocation and reconstruction. This relocation method constitutes demolition of the barn under the City's definition of demolition (OMC 17.04.023 and 17. 10.090). However, reconstruction of the barn retains the existing mass, scale, and original materials to the greatest extent feasible.

Based on the consultant's historic resource assessment and staff report dated May 1, 2013, the barn is considered a non-contributor to the historic district. Because the barn is considered a non-contributor, the appropriate Design Standards for review of the project are those related to compatible new construction and/or alterations to non-contributors in the historic district. The proposed relocation and reconstruction of the barn appears compatible with the local Old Towne historic district, because it retains the existing mass, scale, roof slope, rolling door, and vertical board siding to the greatest extent feasible. The barn's orientation parallel to W. Palm Avenue and its visibility from the public right-of-way will be retained. The existing openings will be infilled with a combination of aluminum frame windows and horizontal wood siding, clearly differentiated from the original vertical board siding. The infill will also be inset approximately three inches from the face of the original siding to further differentiate the infill from the original material. The small

26 square foot addition on the south elevation is similarly differentiated with horizontal wood siding and compatible with the original materials. The proposed reconstruction of the barn appears to be in conformance with provisions of the Design Standards related to new construction within the historic district.

Issue 2 – Compatibility of New Construction:

The applicant proposes to construct a new 1,899 square foot, 1 ½ story building with one housing unit at the rear of the property and a new 604 square foot, two-car garage to the east of the contributing building. The proposed new construction conforms with the R-2-6 zoning standards. The 700-800 block of W. Palm Avenue has three contributors in a total of 15 properties. Given the adjacent multi-family properties and losses of integrity to the historic streetscape, the increased density and new construction is appropriate for this location and will not cause further losses of integrity to the historic district.

The proposed new garage has design elements compatible with the historic district, including the front gable roof, exposed rafter tails, and wood siding, and is in keeping with the mass and scale of historic carriage houses and garages found in the historic district. The new garage is proposed at a setback of 31 feet, 10 inches, approximately in line with the front door of the contributing building, but set back from the line of the front porch. This location is closer to the street than is typical of carriage houses and garages associated with contributors to the historic district. However, the proposed garage's small size and use of materials is consistent with the historic district and compatible with the contributing building.

The proposed new housing unit is set at the rear of the property and will take access from N. Clark Street. This location and new access reduces impacts to the street facing elevation of the contributing building and will give the appearance of a separate property from W. Palm Avenue. The proposed 1 ½ story height with small dormers is generally compatible with the mass and scale of the historic district and will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, due to the placement of the new garage. The building is differentiated from the contributing building and from the barn through the use of materials, such as the vertical fiber cement board and batten siding which references the property's agricultural history without replicating the original materials found on the older buildings on the property. The proposed new construction appears to be compatible with the local Old Towne historic district and in conformance with the Design Standards.

<b>ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION</b>
--------------------------------------

**Staff Review Committee:**

The Staff Review Committee reviewed the project on September 19, 2012 and provided preliminary comments.

**Design Review Committee:**

The Design Review Committee reviewed the project on May 1, 2013 and provided preliminary comments.

<b>ATTACHMENTS/EXHIBITS</b>
-----------------------------

Attachments to Report:

1. Planning Commission Resolution
2. Vicinity Map
3. Drawings, dated August 10, 2013
4. Barn Relocation Method
5. Material Board
6. Photographs
7. Design Review Committee Staff Report dated May 1, 2013
8. Design Review Committee Meeting Minutes dated May 1, 2013

cc: Rick Fox  
Stratos Form  
275 S. Glassell Street  
Orange, CA 92866

Guy Alexander  
GCA Landholdings, LLC  
3185 F-2 Airway Avenue  
Costa Mesa, CA 92626