DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE:	AUGUST 21, 2013
TO:	Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU:	Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM:	Marissa Moshier, Historic Preservation Planner
SUBJECT:	DRC NO. 4685-13 – PALM AVENUE HOUSING

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to relocate and reconstruct an existing 424 square foot barn and construct a 26 square foot addition; to construct a new detached 604 square foot, two-car garage; and to construct a new 1 ½ story, one unit, 1,899 residential building with garage on a parcel that contains a one-story, 1,681 square foot contributor to the local Old Towne historic district. The barn is considered a non-contributor to the historic district. The applicant proposes to take access from a new driveway at the southwest corner of the property at N Clark St.

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Staff recommends that DRC recommend the project to Planning Commission.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant:	Rick Fox – Palm Ave Housing
Property Owner:	GCA Landholdings, LLC
Property Location:	730 W Palm Ave
Existing General Plan Land Use Element designation:	Medium Density Residential (6 to 15 Du/Ac)
Existing Zoning Classification:	R-2-6 (Duplex Residential District)
Old Towne:	Yes, contributing one-story 1914 bungalow
Specific Plan/PC:	N/A
Site Size:	.13 Acre (14,182 sq. ft.)
Surrounding land uses and Zoning:	R-2-6 to east, west, and south; R-1-6 to north
Previous Applications/Entitlements:	None
Associated applications	Minor Site Plan Review No. 0705-12

Previous DRC Review	Preliminary comments on May 1, 2013
Mills Act Contract	No
Associated Code Enforcement Case	None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15301 (Class 1 - Existing Facilities), 15302 (Class 2 – Replacement or Reconstruction), and 15303 (Class 3 – New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures). There is no public review required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project includes relocation and reconstruction of the existing barn to the northwest of its existing location. A new 26 square foot addition will be constructed at the south elevation of the barn to bring the size to the required minimum 450 square feet for an accessory housing unit. Based on the findings of the consultant report and previous staff report (dated May 1, 2013), the barn is considered a non-contributor to the local Old Towne historic district. A new 1,899 square foot, 1 ½ story building with one dwelling unit will be constructed at the rear southeast corner of the parcel. A new 604 square foot, two-car garage will be constructed to the east of the existing residence. Access to the reconstructed barn and residential building will be provided through a new driveway onto N Clark St, a cul-de-sac at the southwest corner of the site.

EXISTING SITE

The 14,182 square foot property is developed with a one-story, single family residence and barn. The 1,681 square foot residence was constructed in 1914 and is a contributor to the local Old Towne historic district. The building has been recently rehabilitated. The property also contains a 424 square foot detached barn structure at the rear.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The property is located on the south side of W Palm Ave, east of N Batavia St (APN 386-451-38) in the northwest quadrant of the local Old Towne historic district, outside of the National Register historic district. The property has three adjacent residential lots with two non-contributing buildings (constructed in 1956 and 1979) and one contributing building constructed in 1920. The south side of the 700-800 block of W Palm Ave contains a mixture of non-contributing one and two-story multi-family apartments with two contributing residential properties. The lots on the south side range in size from 7,157, to 26,136 square feet in area. The north side of W Palm Ave has one contributing single family residence surrounded by non-

contributing single family residences. The Floor Area Ratio (FAR) for the block ranges from .14 FAR to .34 FAR, with an average FAR of .21. The subject property has an existing .15 FAR.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.
   a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
   b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape**.
   a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
   b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
   c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
3. **Signage**. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.
4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner, which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1 - Relocation and Reconstruction of Barn:

The applicant proposes a three phase process for relocating and reconstructing the barn. In Phase 1, a new structure, including concrete slab with curb, waterproofing, and roof structure, will be constructed and prepared to receive the barn wall panels. In Phase 2, the barn will be prepared for relocation by replacing deteriorated vertical wood boards as necessary, removing and storing the existing rolling door and track, bracing the exterior walls, installing temporary collar ties at existing top plates, and removing the existing roof structure and cladding. In Phase 3, each of the four wall surfaces will be detached as panels, moved intact, and attached to the new structure. Please see Attachment 3: Barn Relocation Method for a more detailed description of the relocation and reconstruction. This proposal retains the existing mass, scale, and original materials to the greatest feasible.

Based on the consultant report, previous staff report and minutes of the Design Review Committee meeting on May 1, 2013, the barn is considered a non-contributor to the historic district. Because the barn is considered a non-contributor, the appropriate guidelines for review of the project are those related to compatible new construction and/or alterations to non-contributors in the historic district.

Issue 2 – Compatibility of New Construction:

The applicant proposes to construct a new 1,899 square foot, 1 ½ story building with one dwelling unit at the rear of the property and a new 604 square foot, two-car garage to the east of the contributing building. The proposed new construction conforms to the R-2-6 zoning standards. The 700-800 block of W Palm Ave has three contributors in a total of 15 properties. Given the adjacent multi-family properties and losses of integrity to the historic streetscape, the increased density and new construction is appropriate for this location and will not cause further losses of historic materials.

The proposed new garage has design elements compatible with the historic district, including the front gable roof, exposed rafter tails, and wood siding, and is in keeping with the mass and scale of historic carriage houses and garages found in the historic district. The new garage is proposed at a setback of 31 feet, 10 inches, approximately in line with the front door of the contributing building, but set back from the line of the front porch. This location is closer to the street than is typical of carriage houses and garages associated with contributors to the historic district. However, the proposed garage's small size and use of materials is consistent with the historic district and compatible with the contributing building.

The proposed new residential building is set at the rear of the property and will take access from N Clark St. This location and new access reduces impacts to the street facing elevation of the contributing building. The proposed 1 ½ story height with small dormers is generally compatible with the mass and scale of the historic district, and the building is differentiated from the contributing building and from the barn through the use of materials, such as the vertical fiber cement board and batten siding which references the property's agricultural history without replicating the original materials found on the older buildings on the property.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project.

The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).*

   The proposed relocation and reconstruction of the barn appears compatible with the local Old Towne historic district, because it retains the existing mass, scale, roof slope, rolling door, and vertical board siding to the greatest extent feasible. The barn's orientation parallel to W Palm Ave and its visibility from the public right of way will be retained. The existing openings will be infilled with a combination of aluminum frame windows and horizontal wood siding, clearly differentiated from the original vertical board siding. The infill will also be inset approximately three inches from the face of the original siding to further differentiate the infill from the original material. The small 26 square foot addition on the south elevation is similarly differentiated with horizontal wood siding.

   Although the proposed new construction increases the density of the property, the new buildings are sufficiently compatible in mass, scale and proportion to the contributing building and to the Old Towne historic district as a whole. Although the proposed new garage has a smaller setback than is typically found in the historic district, the garage is set back from the contributor's front porch, is small in size, and uses materials consistent with the historic district and compatible with the contributor.

   The new residential building is set back from the contributing building at the rear of the property. The 1 ½ story height of the new building will be minimally visible from the public right of way, due to the placement of the new garage. The proposed new driveway from N Clark St will reduce the impacts to the street-facing elevation of the contributing building and will give the appearance of a separate property from W Palm Ave. The proposed fiber cement board and batten siding differentiates the new building from the horizontal wood siding of the contributing residence and from the vertical board siding of the barn.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).*

   Because the property is outside of the National Register historic district, this finding does not apply.

3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).*

As the project is located within the Old Towne historic district, the proposed work must conform with the prescriptive standard and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the Design Review Committee. As described above, the project conforms with the Old Towne Design Standards.

4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).*

   As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to projects located within the Old Towne historic district, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. All construction shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with plans labeled Attachment 2 (dated August 1, 2013) and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. The barn shall be relocated and reconstructed as described in Attachment 3: Barn Relocation Method. The vertical board siding shall be retained to the greatest extent feasible.
3. Prior to issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a water improvement plan to the Water Division for new fire hydrants, domestic water services, fire services, landscape services, and/or any other proposed improvements or relocations affecting the public water system appurtenances for review and approval. The applicant shall be responsible for the costs associated with the proposed improvements.
4. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall be responsible for the installation/relocation of the proposed/existing public water system appurtenances as necessitated by the proposal to a location and of a design per the improvement plans approved by the Water Division.
5. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that the water improvement plans are consistent with the fire suppression plans and/or fire master plan. The applicant's consultant preparing the water improvement plans shall coordinate their plans with the consultant preparing the fire suppression plans and/or fire master plan so that their designs concur.
6. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, plans shall show that each building shall be protected with a separate fire service unless otherwise approved by the Fire Department and Water Division.

7. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, plans shall show that each building shall be protected with a separate fire service unless otherwise approved by the Fire Department and Water Division.
8. Prior to issuance of a building permit, the Water Division shall approve the type and location of landscaping back flow prevention device and fire service (detector check) device for proposed City services.
9. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that a minimum twenty-foot (20') separation will be maintained from the public water system facilities to the proposed/existing buildings and structures per the City of Orange Location of Underground Utilities Standard.
10. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that the installation of sewer mains in the vicinity of water mains is done per the Water Division's Standard No. 113.
11. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that a six foot minimum horizontal clearance and a one foot minimum vertical clearance would be maintained between City water mains, laterals, services, meters, fire hydrants and all other utilities except sewer.
12. Plans submitted during plan check shall that an eight-foot minimum clearance is provided between City water mains, and sign, trees or other substantial shrubs, bushes, or plants.
13. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that the minimum separation requirements are met and that each of the various designers' plan sets concurs. The applicant's consultant preparing the improvement and utility plans shall coordinate their plans with the consultants preparing the landscape, architectural, surface water quality management, fire master, and/or fire suppression plans that their designs are consistent.
14. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that permanent signs, awnings, surface water quality management features such as but not limited to infiltration planters, basins, pervious paving structures or other structures are not installed over the City's water mains, laterals, services, meters and fire hydrants.
15. Plans submitted during plan check shall show that each property, residence, main building or structure shall have a separate meter service unless otherwise approved by the Water Division.
16. Prior to approval of the water improvement plan, the applicant shall satisfy all water main connection, plan check and inspection charges as determined by the Water Division.
17. All hot taps required on existing City mains to provide water service to any lot, parcel or subdivision shall be performed by City crews at the developer's expense in accordance with the fee schedule established by resolution of the City Council.
18. That a minimum of fourteen calendar days prior to construction, the applicant's civil engineer shall prepare and provide product material submittals consistent with the approved water improvement plans for all proposed public water systems facilities to the Water Division for review and approval.

19. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the applicant shall furnish and install individual pressure regulators on new services where the incoming pressure exceeds eighty pounds per square inch.

The following code provisions are applicable to this project and are include for information only. This is not a complete list of requirements and other code provisions may apply to the project.

- Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall pay all applicable development fees, including but not limited to: City sewer connection, Orange County Sanitation District Connection Fee, Transportation System Improvement Program, Fire Facility, Park Acquisition, Sanitation District, and School District, as required.
- Building permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this design review permit.
- All structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code – Chapter 15.52 (Building Security Standards), which related to hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc. (Ord. 7-79). Approved structural drawings shall include sections of the security code that apply. Specifications, details, or security notes may be used to convey the compliance.
- These conditions shall be reprinted on the first page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Department for the plan check process.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Location Map
2. Drawings, dated August 1, 2013
3. Barn Relocation Method
4. Material Board
5. Photographs

cc: Rick Fox
Stratos Form
275 S Glassell St
Orange, CA 92866

Guy Alexander
GCA Landholdings, LLC
3185 F-2 Airway Ave
Costa Mesa, CA 92626