DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE:	MAY 15, 2013
TO:	Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU:	Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM:	Daniel Ryan, Historic Preservation Planner
SUBJECT:	DRC No. 4688-13 – ST. JOHN'S LUTHERAN CHURCH – ACCESS RAMP

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to install a new handicapped access ramp for church patrons using Walker Hall located between Shaffer and Center Streets on the north side of Almond Avenue. The proposed ramp is constructed of concrete with iron railings. The proposed materials and finishes match the existing railing and concrete foundation.

RECOMMENDED ACTION – FINAL DETERMINATION

Staff recommends the DRC approve the project as submitted.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner:	St. John's Lutheran Church
Property Location:	184 S. Shaffer Street Old Towne Orange Historic District
General Plan Designation:	PI (Public Institutional)
Zoning Classification:	SP (St. John's Specific Plan)
Existing Development:	Existing Church Complex 36,454 sq. ft.
Property Size:	.91 Acre (39,640 sq. ft.)
Associated Applications:	None
Previous DRC Review:	None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Sections 15303 and 15331. Section 15303 – (Class 3 New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) and

Guideline 15331 – (Class 31 - Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) consists of projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. There is no public review required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

St. John's Lutheran Church is proposing to install a new handicapped access ramp for church patrons using Walker Hall located between Shaffer and Center Streets on the north side of Almond Avenue. The proposed ramp is constructed of pre-cast concrete. The new iron railings and concrete will match the existing concrete finish and existing railing of Walker Hall. The height of the landing at the top of the existing stairs is approximately five-feet in height. The west stair landing leads to the dining room/kitchen area, whereas, the east stair landing provides access to the student music room and the remainder of Walker Hall. The open area between the main sanctuary and Walker Hall has a paved area with 5" x 5" and 9" x 5" diagonal laid pavers. It is cordoned off with a chain between two small bollards right behind the existing sidewalk. The proposal includes removing these and installing new bollards approximately 17 feet back, so that handicapped patrons can be dropped off when street parking on Almond is not available.

Between the street curb and the sidewalk is a seven foot-six inch (7'-6") parkway, then a five foot (5'-0") wide sidewalk and ten foot (10'-0") setback to the face of the building (excluding the existing landing and stairs). This leaves sufficient room for sidewalk width and a new switch back ramp arrangement. To facilitate the movement of walkers and wheelchairs, the proposal includes installing matching brick 5" x 5" and 5"x 9" cast pavers installed in a diagonal pattern in the existing parkway. These pavers will match the existing pavers currently placed on the driveway between the main sanctuary and Walker Hall. The new railing will be powder-coated black steel tubing 4" on center, with a matching cast iron emblem as the existing iron railing.

EXISTING SITE AND CONTEXT

The existing 39,640 square foot campus contains several historic building within the St. John's Lutheran Church Complex including the main 1914 Gothic styled church at 185 South Center, the Old Parsonage at 171 South Center, Walker Hall at 184 South Shaffer and the School at 515 East Almond Avenue. The Walker Hall and school complex were constructed in 1927 in the Mediterranean Revival style. It has a 600 seat auditorium, kitchen, dining room, meeting room and lobby.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.

a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.

b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.

2. **Landscape**.

a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.

b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.

c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.

3. **Signage**.

a. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.

4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1 – Design and Placement of Proposed Handicapped Access Ramp:

Over the last several years St. John's Lutheran Church, has examined multiple options for providing handicapped access to Walker Hall located along Almond Avenue and Shaffer Street, east of Center Street. With an aging congregation, there has been an increase in the use of walkers and wheelchairs at this facility. A critical need is for church patrons to easily and safely transverse entry and exiting from the sidewalk to the raised floor of Walker Hall.

The proposed concept serves a dual purpose allowing handicapped access to the dining room and kitchen area on the west as well as the east entry to the student music room and the remaining interior of Walker Hall. The location of the ramp on the south side of Walker Hall along Almond Avenue was selected as the best option, one that would have the least impact on the secondary façade of Walker Hall. The proposed design will take existing elements such as the existing metal railing and the concrete foundation and use these materials on the new ramp. The existing setback for the building along Almond Avenue and the existing five-foot wide public sidewalk will provide adequate room to construct the ramp and exceed the allowed width of the required sidewalk at this location. The proposal is complementary in design, materials and placement so that it does not impact the existing architectural features of the building and/or its view to the public.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).*

   The installation of a new handicapped ramp on the south secondary elevation of Walker Hall will provide the best and most direct access for church patrons. The placement, design, and materials will match existing materials and finishes. The proposed installation on a secondary façade will not obscure or impact the existing architectural features of the contributing building.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2 and OTDS.)*

   The installation of a new handicapped ramp on the south secondary elevation of Walker Hall will provide the best and most direct access for church patrons. The placement, design, and materials will match existing materials and finishes. The proposed installation on a secondary façade will not obscure or impact the existing architectural features of the contributing building.

3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).*

   The installation of a new handicapped ramp on the south secondary elevation of Walker Hall will provide the best and most direct access for church patrons. The placement and design and materials will match existing materials and finishes. The proposed installation on a secondary façade will not obscure or impact the existing architectural features of the contributing building. The proposal shall be based upon sound principles of land use and comply with the Old Towne Design Standards and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).*

As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to projects located within the Old Towne Orange Historic District, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

Staff recommends the Design Review Committee approve DRC 4688-13 subject to the conditions listed below and any conditions that the Design Review Committee deems appropriate to support the required findings and ensure the preservation of community aesthetics:

All construction shall conform in substance, and be maintained in general conformance, with plans labeled Attachment 2 (dated April 25, 2013) and as recommended or modified by the Design Review Committee.

1. The building plans shall detail the type and pattern of the cast pavers and medallion used on the metal railing.
2. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall pay all of the applicable Development Impact Fees in accordance with the most current fee schedule. Building permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this design review permit.
3. Prior to building permit issuance, construction plans shall show that all structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code (Chapter 15.52 Building Security Standards), which relates to the use of specific hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc (Ord. No. 7-79). Architect drawings shall include sections of the Ordinance that apply under "Security Notes". An "Approved Products List 1/08" of hardware, windows, etc is available upon request.
4. These conditions shall be reprinted on the second page of the construction documents when submitted to the Building Division for the plan check process.
5. Subsequent modifications to the approved architecture and color scheme shall be submitted for review and approval to the Community Development Director or designee. Should the modifications be considered substantial, the modifications shall be reviewed by the City's Design Review Committee.
6. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permits, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceedings and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
7. The applicant shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, including all City regulations. Violation of any of those laws in connection with the use will be cause for revocation of this permit.
8. Design Review Committee No. 4688-13 shall become void if not vested within two years from the date of approval. Time extensions may be granted for up to one year, pursuant to OMC Section 17.08.060.

9. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public hearing.
10. In conjunction with construction, all activity will be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 8:00 p.m. Monday through Saturday. No construction activity will be permitted on Sundays and Federal holidays.
11. Prior to Building Permit issuance, the applicant shall pay any outstanding monies due to the City of Orange for Planning Division entitlement activities related to this project.
12. The term "applicant" shall refer to the entity that requests approval of this action or any successor in interest to this approval.
13. Plans submitted for Building Plan Check shall comply with the California Fire and Building Code as amended by the City and as frequently amended, and in effect, at the time of application for a Building Permit.
14. The following code provisions are applicable to this project and are included for information only. This is not a complete list of requirements and other code provisions may apply to the project.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Small Scale Site and Elevation Plans, dated April 25, 2013

CC:

St. John's Lutheran Church
185 S. Center Street
Orange, Ca 92866

Craig Wheeler
58 Plaza Square,
Orange Ca 92866