DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE:	APRIL 17, 2013
TO:	Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU:	Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM:	Daniel Ryan, Historic Preservation Planner
SUBJECT:	DRC No. 4680-13 – MASSARO – FACADE REMODEL

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes new facade remodel for a contributing one-story 1922 "Western Falsefront industrial building within the Downtown Core. The proposal is to change the existing layout of windows and doors on the front façade and rear facades to accommodate the use of the building as a graphics and printing business. The original pressed tin and corrugated materials found on the building including the roofing will be restored.

RECOMMENDED ACTION-FINAL DETERMINATION

Staff recommends the DRC review the proposed façade modifications as submitted.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant:	Anthony Massaro (Mars Hill Studio Inc.)
Owner:	149 North Lemon LLC
Property Location:	145 N. Lemon Street, Plaza Historic District
General Plan Designation:	OTMIX (Old Towne Mixed Use, Maximum 15 Du/Ac)
Zoning Classification:	OTMU-SP (Old Towne Mixed Use- Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan)
Existing Development:	Existing 5,890 sq. ft. building
Property Size:	.18 Acre (7,841 sq. ft.)
Associated Applications:	None
Previous DRC Review:	None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15301 Section

15331. Section 15301(Class 1- Existing Facilities) consists of the repair, maintenance, or minor alteration of existing private structures, exterior alterations and/or topographical features, and Section 15331(Class 31 - Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) consists of projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. There is no public review required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The existing interior space of 5,890 square feet of the contributing industrial building will be remodeled to accommodate the office expansion of a local graphics firm. The existing elevation has a wide truck service door on the south side of the front façade, a man door then three evenly spaced divided light windows, another man door and one more divided light window. The applicant is proposing to create a symmetrically, aligned façade with two wide service doors on each end of the building, two centered double entry doors, with two divided light windows on each side of the centered entrance. An awning is proposed over the two double entry doors, the exterior finish is T1-11 vertical wood siding, wood windows and trim.

The upper portion of the front façade with pressed tin exterior will be maintained and restored as will be the rear upper portion of that façade which consists of corrugated metal siding. The man and service doors are to be wood. The proposed wide service door on the north is for UPS pick up, where as the south service door is for deliveries and interior parking of the company vehicle. The north service door will not require a new curb cut.

The existing rear elevation currently consists of an eight foot wide barn door on the south, a double wide wood window, a man door, another wide window and one small window on the north end. The windows and doors are in poor condition and are currently covered with iron security bars. The applicant is proposing to modify the rear façade, by installing a series of glass sliding wood doors: two doors to replace the barn door opening on the south, removal of the two windows and man door, their replacement with four sliding glass doors (centered on elevation) and one new glass man door on the north. The existing vent on the rear gable will be replaced with two trimmed out wood windows. The open rear yard area will be used for an employee rest area.

No signs are proposed with this submission. The applicant is proposing to have address signs over each of the front service doors, illuminated with goose neck lighting fixtures. One existing interior parking space will remain in use for the company vehicle. The applicant is currently completing seismic/structural upgrading and installing a new corrugated steel roof that matches the original.

EXISTING SITE

The one-story 5,890 sq. ft. building addressed as 145 N. Lemon Street is classified as a contributing industrial building located in the Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan Area. The former business "Creative Cakes" was a bakery and retail establishment which operated at that site from 2008 to 2012. The 1922 one-story industrial building has a Western False front designed with an open truss interior. The tall segmented false front and raised parapet have remained original and

untouched, whereas, the lower street façade has had several major façade changes. The treatment of the upper false front façade is pressed tin, with a centered vent, and a projecting blade sign. The lower portion of the structure on all sides is T-111 vertical wood siding. The building fronts directly on Lemon Street, One enclosed parking space is provided.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The north 100 block of Lemon Street contains a mix of industrial, commercial, duplex and retail uses. Most of the buildings are one-story, with a mixture of both contributing and non-contributing structures. There is a mix of commercial and industrial serving uses including: residential, retail, antique dealers, restaurants and office uses. This project is within and subject to the new Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan Development Guidelines.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.
    a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
    b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape**.
    a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
    b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
    c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
3. **Signage**.
    a. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.
4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

In the following analysis, Staff has referenced the Orange Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan Design Guidelines.

Issue 1 – General Treatment of Industrial Buildings & Recommendations:

Roof:

1. The preservation of historic roof forms and support systems.
2. The rehabilitation/replacement of roof systems, due to deterioration or structural issues, using the same or similar materials and design.
3. The retention of the building facade, original roof line and materials, including raised parapet and decorative details

The applicant has undertaken the removal of rolled roofing which was installed over the original and existing metal corrugated roofing. New sheathing will be installed and the existing or new matching metal corrugated roofing will be reinstalled depending on its condition. Seismic and structural repairs on the existing the open building frame and single-wall construction are also proposed. The original tin siding on the upper section of the front façade will be restored.

Window Treatment

1. Consideration of the pattern of punctuation along the wall plane should be considered when adding new windows. The new window should appear visually similar to the historic windows, but not an exact duplication.

Door/Entry Treatment

1. Metal-clad industrial buildings often feature simple entry doors on the primary elevation.
2. Garage bay doors provide opportunities for new uses while retaining the original openings and keeping the industrial character of the building intact. The treatment of historic garage and loading bay doors in rehabilitation projects should include:
    a. The retention and repair of original openings and doors of industrial buildings where possible.
    b. The removal of inappropriate non-historic replacements and repairs is encouraged.
    c. Replacing of doors, when necessary, with a door style that is similar to the historic, and the preservation of the door original frame, when feasible.
    d. Retaining auto repair garage doors and openings, when feasible. If not feasible to accommodate new use, retain garage opening and replace door with a new door which is consistent with the building's historic character

The existing and proposed window and man door fenestration is laid out symmetrically, with three windows centered on the front façade with one man door on each side. The rest of the façade has another window on the north and a wide service door on the south side of the front elevation. The proposed façade is also laid out symmetrically with matching wide service doors at each end, a centered double door entry with two trimmed out wood windows on each side. The proposed window, door and service doors are consistent with the industrial building form with its service doors, and in the alignment and fenestration pattern of its entry doors and windows.

The proposed design of the service doors with the top row divided lights is too formal for an industrial building. Staff has discussed this item with the applicant and is recommending that the garage or service doors be simplified and/or similar to the existing wood panel service door.

Materials Treatment

Industrial buildings were constructed using a wide range of materials including metal. These exterior finishes are an important character-defining features of industrial buildings. The treatment of historic materials in rehabilitation projects should include:

a. The retention of industrial wall treatments, such as corrugated iron panels.
b. The removal of inappropriate siding which covers original materials.

The applicant is proposing to keep both the pressed tin exterior on the upper front façade, and retain, repair, and replace only where necessary the existing corrugated metal siding on the roof and the rear elevation. The lower front façade on the north, south and west or street elevations is currently sided with a modern vertical wood siding (T1-11). This is evident from the 1991 survey photographs; no evidence is in place to indicate the original siding material. As such, the applicant has an option to keep or replace the T1-11 siding. The applicant is proposing to install new wood four-inch reverse board and batten siding. This complies with the SFDSP Design Guidelines to remove inappropriate siding material. The entry awning, goose neck lighting and proposed

Issue 2 – Facade Modifications to Accommodate the New Use:

The lower section of the front façade has undergone multiple modifications overtime; no historical documentation including period photographs have been found. The building industrial façade was once an automotive use, then most recently a wholesale/retail bakery. As such, the proposal is to provide a façade that has some industrial elements such as the wide service doors, but allows a change in the door and entry treatments to accommodate the new use as a printing company. The applicant is proposing to replace the existing horizontal wood vents located on the upper portion of the front façade with two new vertical divided light windows to gain more light within the building. The applicant is proposing to install and/or expand the number of roof skylights. Staff does not see the need to remove this defining feature, Staff has discussed this item with the applicant, and is recommending that it be retained.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).*

   a. The proposed facade remodel retains the existing defining features of the building including the upper Western falsefront parapet with its pressed tin exterior, and the retention of the metal corrugated siding/roofing, and restoration of the wood siding. The layout of doors and windows and the entry is consistent with the design and reuse of this contributing industrial building.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2 and OTDS.)*

   The proposal is based upon sound principles of land use and complies with the specific Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines.

3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).*

   The proposed work conforms to the Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan prescriptive standards and design guidelines for historic buildings including following: The *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation*

   i. Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a building shall be avoided.

   ii. Standard 5: Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

   iii. Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).*

   As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to projects located within the Old Towne Orange Historic District, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

Staff recommends the Design Review Committee approval of DRC No. 4680-13 subject to the conditions listed below and any conditions that the Design Review Committee deems appropriate to support the required findings and ensure the preservation of community aesthetics.

All construction shall conform in substance, and be maintained in general conformance, with plans labeled Attachment 3 (dated April 4, 2013) and as recommended or modified by the Design Review Committee.

1. Keep the existing horizontal wood vents located on the upper portion of the front façade.
2. Simplify and/or keep the existing wood panel garage or service doors to reflect the existing industrial character of building.
3. Prior to building permit issuance, the applicant shall pay all of the applicable Development Impact Fees in accordance with the most current fee schedule. Building permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this design review permit.
4. Prior to building permit issuance, construction plans shall show that all structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code (Chapter 15.52 Building Security Standards), which relates to the use of specific hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc (Ord. No. 7-79). Architect drawings shall include sections of the Ordinance that apply under "Security Notes". An "Approved Products List 1/08" of hardware, windows, etc is available upon request.
5. These conditions shall be reprinted on the second page of the construction documents when submitted to the Building Division for the plan check process.
6. Subsequent modifications to the approved architecture and color scheme shall be submitted for review and approval to the Community Development Director or designee. Should the modifications be considered substantial, the modifications shall be reviewed by the City's Design Review Committee.
7. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permits, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any such claim, action, or proceedings and shall cooperate fully in the defense.
8. The applicant shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, including all City regulations. Violation of any of those laws in connection with the use will be cause for revocation of this permit.
9. Design Review Committee No. 4680-13 shall become void if not vested within two years from the date of approval. Time extensions may be granted for up to one year, pursuant to OMC Section 17.08.060.
10. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community

Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public hearing.

11. In conjunction with construction, all activity will be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 8:00 p.m. Monday through Saturday. No construction activity will be permitted on Sundays and Federal holidays.
12. Prior to Building Permit issuance, the applicant shall pay any outstanding monies due to the City of Orange for Planning Division entitlement activities related to this project.
13. The term "applicant" shall refer to the entity that requests approval of this action or any successor in interest to this approval.
14. Plans submitted for Building Plan Check shall comply with the California Fire Code as amended by the City and as frequently amended, and in effect, at the time of application for a Building Permit.
15. The following code provisions are applicable to this project and are included for information only. This is not a complete list of requirements and other code provisions may apply to the project.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Orange Historic Inventory Survey Sheet
3. Building & photographs, color elevations & material descriptions
4. Full Scale Site, Elevation and Floor Plans, dated April 4, 2013

CC:

Anthony Massaro
Mars Hill Studio Inc.
2533 Greenbrier Lane,
Costa Mesa, ca 92626

North Lemon 145 LLC
177 Riverside Avenue,
Newport Beach, 92663