DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE:	MARCH 20, 2013
TO:	Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU:	Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM:	Anna Pehoushek, Principal Planner
SUBJECT:	MAJOR SITE PLAN (MJSP No. 0649-10) AND DESIGN REVIEW (DRC No. 4675-13) FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW METROLINK PARKING STRUCTURE AND ASSOCIATED COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS

SUMMARY

The City of Orange, in collaboration with OCTA, is proposing a new 611 space parking structure on the site of the existing Lemon Street public parking lot in Old Towne at the northwest corner of Chapman Avenue and Lemon Street. Two commercial buildings are proposed in conjunction with the parking structure, to be constructed by undetermined private developers in future phases of site development.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

The project went before the Staff Review Committee on February 2, 2011 and again on December 14, 2011 for preliminary comments. At the time the project went before the SRC in February 2011, the project consisted of two parking structures, one on the Lemon Street public parking lot and the second at the site of the Metrolink parking lot west of the railroad tracks. In the months that followed, the site west of the tracks was eliminated as an option by the City due to site constraints. Consequently, the project was modified to focus solely on the Lemon Street lot. The City has developed a preferred design option and is requesting preliminary review of the proposed concept by the Design Review Committee. No findings are stated. This is only a preliminary review.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant:	City of Orange
Owner:	Successor Agency to the Orange Redevelopment Agency
Property Location:	130 North Lemon Street (Lemon Street Public Parking Lot) and 123 North Cypress Street (Old Towne Orange Historic District)
General Plan Designation:	OTMU (6-15 du/ac .5 to 1.0 FAR) (Old Towne Mixed Use)
Zoning Classification:	OTMU-15 (SP) (Old Towne Mixed Use-15 Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan)
Existing Development:	7,542± sq. ft. vacant industrial building (123-129 N. Cypress Street) and 172-space public surface parking lot and alley

Property Size:	Approx. 1.9 acres
Associated Applications:	MJSP No. 649-10, ENV No. 1832-13 & DRC No. 4675-13
Previous DRC Review:	None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project for purposes of preliminary review.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

An Environmental Assessment will be prepared for the proposed project in accordance with the National Environmental Protection Act. A Mitigated Negative Declaration will also be prepared to evaluate the potential environmental impacts of the project in accordance with the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15070 and in conformance with Local CEQA Guidelines.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The City, in collaboration with OCTA, proposes to construct a new parking structure on the site of the Lemon Street Parking Lot and adjacent vacant industrial property at 123-129 North Cypress Street to meet the anticipated parking demand of the future Metrolink service expansion. The non-contributing (1946) industrial building would be demolished to accommodate the proposed project.

The structure would provide a total of approximately 611 structure parking spaces in 5-levels of parking for transit (500 spaces) and general (111 spaces) use associated with the proposed commercial buildings. Two of the levels would be subterranean. A pedestrian paseo adjacent to the alley, and bicycle plaza that would accommodate City bike lockers are included in the proposed project.

The comprehensive program for the site includes future construction of a restaurant at the corner of Chapman and Lemon, and retail use at the south end of the parking structure, immediately north of the alley. The restaurant and retail uses would be developed by an undetermined private entity at some point in the future. Until that time, as an interim use for those portions of the site would be developed with 53 surface parking spaces for general public use. During the interim condition a total of 664 parking spaces would be available onsite.

The project site falls within the boundaries of the Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan and is zoned Public Institution (PI-(SP)) (parking structure area) and Old Towne Mixed Use-15 (OTMIX-15(SP)) for the future restaurant and retail pad portions of the site. The maximum height for the OTMIX-15 (SP) zone is 28’, and 32’ in the PI (SP) zone.

Proposed top-of-parapet building height is 26’6”. Two elevator towers are proposed at the north and south end of the building, with a maximum height of 39’. Photovoltaic panels would be mounted on the top deck of the parking structure (centered on the deck) to generate power for the structure. At their highest point, the panels would measure 43’2” above grade. Lighting to

illuminate the top deck of the parking structure would be installed underneath the photovoltaic panel to eliminate the need for parking lot light standards on the top deck of the structure. A line of sight study has been provided with the plans for DRC reference, and indicates that the solar panels become visible from sidewalk level at a distance of 65'. The elevator towers constitute 1.8% of the top parking deck footprint, while the photovoltaic panels cover 23.4% of the top deck. A mechanical shaft tower accounts for an additional 0.6% of the top deck footprint.

The parking structure would have a 7' landscaped setback from the 8' sidewalk. The orientation of the parking structure to the street reinforces the street edge on Lemon Street, and creates a visual environment on Lemon that is more consistent with other Spoke Street side streets in the vicinity of the Plaza and Depot.

EXISTING SITE AND AREA CONTEXT

The site is currently developed with a 172-space surface parking lot (commonly referred to as the Lemon Street Lot) and a vacant industrial building fronting North Cypress Street. The Lemon Street Lot is landscaped with perimeter shrubbery and parking lot trees. There is also a low wrought iron fence with red brick pilasters surrounding the parking lot. Access points for the parking lot include two 2-way access points off of Lemon Street, the one-way public alley accessed from Cypress Street that passes behind the commercial buildings fronting Chapman Avenue, and a one-way exit onto North Cypress Street at the northwest corner of the lot. Existing parking lot lighting consists of cobra head pole lighting. There is also a bus stop located immediately north of the southern Lemon Street access point.

East of the project site along North Lemon Street are six modest single-story residences in the Mediterranean Revival/Art Modern, Bungalow, Hip Roof Cottage (all contributing), and contemporary styles (non-contributing). The contributing structures have dates of construction ranging from 1905-1930. There are also a series of historic non-residential properties south of the residences including the Art Modern Plaza Muffler/Hoffman Radiator building (contributing), Western False Front Taco Mesa and former Creative Cakes buildings (contributing), and corrugated metal industrial FCE Auto Repair (non-contributing). The dates of construction for these structures range from 1922-1946.

South of the project site are commercial buildings along Chapman Avenue including the Omega Burger, Architects Orange, and Blacks Furniture buildings. The style of these single-story buildings are eclectic and include contemporary (non-contributing), and 1920s brick commercial with heavily altered facades (non-contributing). South across Chapman Avenue is the 1935 Spanish Colonial Revival Post Office (contributing), and two single-story contemporary (1946 & 1955) commercial buildings (non-contributing) housing Snow's Automotive, and a paint store and Pizza Hut.

West of the project site are Cypress Street properties including three single-story c. 1905 Hipped Roof Cottage residences (contributing), and the c. 1923 industrial masonry Blake and Nation auto body building (contributing). Further west across Cypress Street are a combination of single-story non-contributing historic and contemporary industrial buildings (1935, 1967 and 1971).

North of the project site is the surface parking lot of the Chapman University Dodge School of Film and Media Arts, with the contemporary film school building further north across the parking lot. Northwest of the project site is the historic Anaconda West property, which is presently undergoing construction to accommodate adaptive reuse of the historic industrial building at the southwest corner of Maple Avenue and Cypress Street for academic facilities, a parking structure, and University tennis facilities. Northeast of the project site is a vacant lot.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the Design Review Committee should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.
    a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
    b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape**.
    a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
    b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
    c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
3. **Signage**. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.
4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner, which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1: Parking Structure Architecture:

The design of the proposed parking structure is a reflection of the project's fundamental objective to maximize the amount of parking that can be accommodated on the site to satisfy anticipated Metrolink parking demand, as well as to address the City's need for additional public parking in Old Towne. Critical to the project design is the harmonious integration of the parking structure into the Historic District. After receiving input from the public and City Council in 2009, 2011 and 2012, two design options have been developed for the parking structure. Due to

the size and form of the parking structure, the architecture takes its cues from the larger scale industrial buildings to its west (north and south of Chapman) along the railroad corridor.

Recognizing that the site falls at a transition point between the historic commercial development surrounding the Plaza and the industrial buildings along the rail corridor, both design alternatives include a brick exterior wall finish in response to the historic masonry commercial and industrial buildings in the surrounding area and to employ a finer-grained building material in scale and character with the pedestrian activity that characterizes the surrounding environs.

Two design alternatives have been developed to reflect feedback received from the community and City Council in 2011. Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC on each of the alternatives, and associated landscape and streetscape features. The design alternative preferred by the DRC will be further refined based on the Committee input's and brought back to DRC for a final recommendation as part of the Major Site Plan review process.

Aesthetic Alternative 1

Aesthetic Alternative 1 (Alternative 1) features large arched openings of a size that references an historic industrial aesthetic. The style of the opening echoes the style of window opening found on many historic masonry commercial buildings in Old Towne. The concrete parking deck spandrels would be visible through the openings along the east, north, and northern end of the west elevations, while the openings have been designed with a filled-in appearance on the south and most of the west elevations. This provides a solid wall where the parking structure meets the property line on the west, and where the parking structure would interface with a future retail building on the south.

To provide additional wall articulation, brick pilasters with a precast concrete base have been incorporated on all four elevations. The parking structure parapet would be finished with a pre-cast concrete cap. Elevator shafts would be finished with glass panels to maximize visibility and security. Parking structure access points would be accented with metal canopies.

Historically referenced packing crate graphics/public art would be integrated along the east elevation of the parking structure to add visual interest, and also an attractive interface for the residences across Lemon Street to the east. The graphics/public art would be down-lit with historically referenced gooseneck lighting.

Aesthetic Alternative 2

Aesthetic Alternative 2 (Alternative 2) offers the same footprint and features as Option 1, however here the architecture draws references from building form and storefront window mullion style of various historic commercial buildings in Old Towne (e.g., Moonlight Graham Building, C.W. Moss Ford Parts Building). Parking structure openings are square with metal mullions. As with Alternative 1, the south and west elevations presented in Alternative 2 are largely solid walls. The east elevation is open to a greater extent under Alternative 2 than under Alternative 1, but continues to incorporate historic crate label imagery. Parking deck spandrels would have greater exposure under Alternative 2 than under Alternative 1. Due to the stylistic difference in the architecture, the expanse of the parking structure's western elevation would be broken up by a series of pilasters.

Brick Treatment

The proposed brick exterior finish would be brick veneer. Staff has explored the use of either red or buff brick for the two design alternatives. Both colors are found in the commercial and industrial buildings of Old Towne. Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC on the appropriate color choice for the Committee's preferred design alternative.

Issue 2: Commercial Building Architecture:

The overall project concept includes two commercial buildings in addition to the parking structure. One consists of a 4,300 sq. ft. restaurant building at the northwest corner of Chapman Avenue and Lemon Street. The second building is expected to be a 15,000 sq. ft. retail space. These future buildings are intended to ease the integration of the parking structure with the surrounding historic urban fabric, and also to reinforce the historic building pattern along Chapman Avenue and Cypress Street.

The proposed design of the commercial buildings draws from the main design theme of the two parking structure alternatives, yet more fully integrates pedestrian oriented building elements in response to the surrounding Old Towne environment. The proposed design of the commercial buildings is a reflection of the parking structure design options. This approach is intended to give the overall project an integrated appearance.

Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC regarding the conceptual design of the commercial buildings in relation to the parking structure design options.

Retail Building

The proposed 15,000 sq. ft. retail building would abut the southern elevation of the parking structure, covering much of that elevation. Open storefront elements, awnings, packing crate imagery, and pilasters would provide a high level of pedestrian orientation along the alley/pedestrian paseo. The western building elevation would be relatively simple, reflecting the likelihood that Cypress Street would function as a service and delivery point for the building. The height of this building would be consistent with that of the parking structure parapet (26'6").

It should be noted that a future developer may have an interest in pushing the retail building toward Lemon Street to allow for greater visibility from Chapman Avenue. Staff is seeking input from the DRC on this possibility, and would ultimately like to recognize this possibility in the project entitlement.

Restaurant Building

Similar to the larger building, the one-story (21') restaurant building takes its design from the parking structure and incorporates storefront elements consistent with the size and scale of the building, as well as the site's location at a prominent Old Towne corner. The design is responsive to the corner, while being relatively conservative and compatible with its surroundings.

Issue 3: Streetscape/Landscape Treatment:

Landscaping associated with the proposed project is concentrated around the east and north project frontages. Due to the footprint of the parking structure, a 7' deep planting area will be

provided between the parking structure wall and sidewalk, and adjacent to a low brick screen wall fronting Lemon Street at the surface parking lot spaces, and at the bike plaza on Maple Avenue. A concentrated planting of street trees is proposed along Lemon Street and Maple Avenue to provide an attractive pedestrian environment where the parking structure interfaces with the sidewalk. Tree grates would be incorporated to maximize the utility of the 8' sidewalk area. Proposed landscaping would consist of a combination of shrubs and groundcover. Street trees have been preliminarily identified as Crape Myrtles along Lemon Street and Australian Willows along Maple Avenue. The City's recently adopted Santa Fe Depot Specific Plan established a new street tree palette for the Specific Plan Area. This calls for the planting of Southern Magnolias on Lemon Street and an alternating pattern of Southern Magnolias and California Fan Palms along Maple Avenue in response to the street trees associated with the Chapman University properties to the north.

Acorn style light standards are proposed to line the top of the screen walls. The style of the standards would be consistent with the City's standard acorn lighting for Old Towne. The height of the proposed light standards placed on top of the screen wall would be 20'. The height of the acorn lights installed on the sidewalk is approximately 15'6".

Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC on the screen wall along both Lemon and Maple, as well as the height of the proposed light standards on the wall in relation to other acorn light standards installed on the sidewalk.

The proposed project includes improvements to the public alley linking Lemon and Cypress Streets. A dedicated pedestrian sidewalk would be incorporated along the north side of the alley. Due to the interim nature of the surface parking lot, proposed landscaping would be limited. Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC on an appropriate interim and long-term treatment for the pedestrian paseo.

Issue 4: Signage

Proposed signage associated with the parking structure is subtle in character. The main parking structure entrance from Lemon Street would be identified by a projecting sign visible from Lemon Street and Chapman Avenue. Cut out metal letters would be placed on the metal canopy above the Lemon Street structure entrance. Staff is seeking feedback from the DRC on the proposed signage concept for the parking structure entrance.

Staff is also seeking DRC input on the proposed packing crate imagery proposed under design Alternatives 1 and 2 for the east and south parking structure elevations.

Signage associated with future commercial buildings is unknown at this time and would be subject to DRC review and approval at the time a development proposal is submitted to the City by a future developer.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

The project went before the Staff Review Committee on February 2, 2011 and again on December 14, 2011 for preliminary comments.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings. When the DRC reviews the project with the intent of making a final determination, staff will prepare the following findings for the DRC.

Old Towne Historic District – Applies to all projects within the district.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1 and OTDS).*

Old Towne Historic District – National Register Historic District -- additional finding applies to sites within the National Register Historic District.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).*
3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).*
4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).*

   As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to projects located within the Old Towne Orange Historic District, and this project is not a residential project, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

Staff is recommending that the Design Review Committee provide comments and design direction only on the proposed project. No findings are stated. This is only a preliminary review.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Aerial and Site Photographs
3. Preliminary plans labeled March 20, 2013

cc:

Barbara Messick
City of Orange
Economic Development Division

Gary Chubb
Griffin Structures, Inc.
385 Second Street
Laguna Beach, CA 92651

Jim Wirick
LPA Architects
5161 California Avenue, Suite 100
Irvine, CA 92617

N:\CDD\PLNG\Applications\Major Site Plan Review\MJSP 0649-10 Metrolink Parking Structures\DRC-Rpt_PrelimRev_3_20_2013.docx