

# DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE: SEPTEMBER 5, 2012

To: Chair Woollet and Members of the Design Review Committee

THRU: Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager

FROM: Robert Garcia, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: DRC No. 4638-12 – COLGAN RESIDENCE

#### **SUMMARY**

The applicant is proposing the demolition of a one-story single family residence to be replaced with a two-story single family residence consisting of 2,548 square feet.

#### RECOMMENDED ACTION—PRELIMINARY REVIEW

Staff recommends the DRC review the proposal and provide comments to the applicant regarding the design of the proposal to support the required findings and ensure the preservation of community aesthetics.

# BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner: Lorena Arce

Property Location: 137 N. Shattuck Place

General Plan Designation: LDR (Low Density Residential)

Zoning Classification: R-1-6 (Residential Single Family)

Existing Development: Single Family Dwelling and Detached Garage

Property Size: 9,810 square feet

Associated Applications: None Previous DRC Project Review: None

# PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

# ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

**Categorical Exemption:** The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15303 (Class 3 – New Construction) because the project consists of a new single family residence. There is no public review required.

## PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant is proposing to demolish an existing 1,375 square foot one-story single family residence and construct a new 2,548 square foot two-story single family residence. The two story residence would resemble craftsman-style architecture. The proposed two-story residence would be the first on this block.

#### **EXISTING SITE**

The property is a 9,810 square foot lot with a one-story single family residence of 1,375 square feet, with a detached 2,150 square foot garage/workshop. The existing residence has a front yard setback of 32 feet.

## EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject site is surrounded by one-story residential single family dwellings. The subject dwelling and dwellings in the vicinity exhibit a post World War II ranch style architecture with different exterior finishes. There are no two story dwellings on the block. The average size of the existing dwellings on the block is 1,400 square feet. The homes on Shattuck Place with the exception of two residences on the 200 block have a front yard setback of 30 to 35 feet.

#### **EVALUATION CRITERIA**

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

#### 1. **Architectural Features.**

- a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
- b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.

#### ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

The surrounding structures consist of one-story residential homes. This neighborhood is comprised of various floor plans and elevations that utilize one-story layouts. The proposal as submitted does not meet the Infill Guidelines in staff's opinion.

The massing elements that are proposed are not consistent with the existing neighborhood. The two-story front yard massing would establish a new theme for the neighborhood that is not sensitive to the existing neighborhood. The proposed exterior finish of a craftsman interpretation does not fit within the established style of the neighborhood. The existing accessory structure on the subject site would be modified to match the proposed style.

Further, the Infill Guidelines state that the perceived scale of new infill residences should be minimized. To achieve this, two-story buildings should be broken up into smaller architectural components, or include a substantial single-story element. In this case the applicant is proposing

a two-story "box" with architectural elements. The proposed residence is 2,548 square feet and the average size of the existing dwellings on this block is 1,400 square feet.

The elevation are not well articulated, the pattern and arrangement of the openings are not well thought out. The dormers on the roof of the second story give the appearance of a ½ floor making the proposed residence look like a ½-story home. The proposal calls for a front yard setback of 25 feet which meets the required front yard setback of 20 feet. However, the homes on Shattuck Place have a front yard setback of 30 to 35 feet, with the exception of two residences on the 200 block of Shattuck Place that have a front yard setback of 20 feet.

The applicant has indicated that they believe the proposal is sensitive to the existing style and patterns of the neighborhood. They have indicated that the horizontal and vertical massing is downplayed with increased side yards and through the use of minimal floor plates.

Staff request that the DRC review the proposal and provide direction to the applicant.

#### ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None Required

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

- 1. Vicinity Map
- 2. Photographs
- 3. Proposed Plans

cc: Robert Colgan 137 N. Shattuck Place Orange, CA 90262