DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE:	JANUARY 18, 2012
TO:	Chair Cathcart and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU:	Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM:	Daniel Ryan, Historic Preservation Planner
SUBJECT:	DRC No. 4601-11 – CHAPMAN UNIVERSITY - CHURCH CONVERSION

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to restore the former 1923 Mennonite Church, parsonage and garage structures located at the northeast corner of Sycamore Avenue and Olive Street. The church and parsonage will be converted into two residential units for university housing.

RECOMMENDED ACTION – FINAL DETERMINATION

Staff recommends the DRC approve the project as submitted.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant/Owner:	Chapman University – Kris Olsen
Property Location:	145 W. Sycamore Avenue, Old Towne Orange Historic District
General Plan Designation:	LDR (Low Density Residential 2-6 Du/Ac)
Zoning Classification:	R 2-6 (Duplex Residential District)
Existing Development:	Existing 3,972 sq. ft. church complex
Property Size:	.17 Acre (7,600 sq. ft.)
Associated Applications:	None
Previous DRC Review:	None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Sections 15303 and 15331. Section 15303 – (Class 3 New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) and Guideline 15331 – (Class 31 - Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) consists of

projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. There is no public review required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Chapman University is proposing to restore and convert the former 1923 Mennonite Church and adjacent parsonage into housing use by the university. The restoration and conversion package prepared by the applicant's consultant, Aday Architects, documents the development and changes to the church and parsonage over time. The proposal covers research similar to a formal Historic Structures Report. Outlined in the proposal are field notes, identification of defining characteristics, photographic documentation of existing and original building elements, and plans illustrating the proposed changes in maintaining and/or returning both buildings to their respective periods of significance.

Based on photographic documentation, the changes proposed for the main church building are limited to removing the shed roof and returning the spire back to its original design and providing knee braces to the front entry of the church on Sycamore Avenue. The remaining work on the church includes exterior repair and painting. The interior wall of the original church will be exposed and repaired and flooring and door casements will be refinished. The new floor plan will include three bedrooms, bathrooms, living, kitchen and pantry, all constructed without altering any original walls.

The proposed changes to the one-bedroom parsonage includes removing the later exterior walls, exposing the board and batten siding, removing the false parapets, reconstructing the original gable roof, and replacing existing aluminum windows with matching wood windows. A new interior stud wall will be constructed to provide a structural frame work and provide insulation. The bathroom addition on the rear will be removed; the interior will be restored to match existing. The exterior will be returned its original appearance with an entry on Sycamore, and covered rear porch on the rear of the parsonage.

The existing one-car detached garage at the rear of the property will be converted back to a one-car garage. The existing garage door was removed and enclosed for use as a classroom by the former Korean Church. The applicant proposes to install new wood carriage type garage doors and restore the wood sided exterior of the garage.

EXISTING SITE

The existing property is a contributing circa 1923, Western Gothic Revival Church, parsonage and garage located at the northeast corner of Sycamore and Olive Street. The former church building is listed as a contributing building on the City's Historic Building Survey. No notation is made as to the status of the parsonage building, which currently appears to be a non-contributing secondary building. The detached one-car garage takes access off Olive Street; it is original other than the removal of the garage door and in-fill of siding.

The site contained the original 1919 church building which was removed and a larger church was constructed after 1922; the circa date for purposes of the survey is 1923. The parsonage and one-car detached garage was constructed between 1923 and 1927. By 1938, the original 768 sq. ft. gabled roofed parsonage was "remodeled" with a new wing wall, new siding and parapet wall that extended to obscure the existing gable roof. An entrance on Sycamore was enclosed, windows were changed out and a small bathroom was added to the rear of the parsonage.

Since construction the main church building has undergone several renovations and additions to accommodate uses by the church. A new meeting room and sanctuary expansion was added to the north end of the original church building. This area was later converted to classrooms, kitchen and children's bathroom. The top of the original roof spire was modified with a shed roof, whereas, the remaining exterior of the church has remained in tack with its original wood lap siding and wood windows.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The north side of the 100 block of West Sycamore Avenue contains the subject church property and an adjoining parking lot that serves two residences that face Glassell Street. The adjoining Olive Street contains a mix of single, duplex and multi-family residences. The church property is 76' x 100', 7,600 square foot lot, with 3,972 square feet of buildings including a 2,847 sq. ft. main church, 860 sq. ft. parsonage and a 265 sq. ft. garage. The existing Floor Area Ratio is .52 FAR.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features**.
    a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
    b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape**.
    a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
    b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
    c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.

3. **Signage**.

   a. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.

4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features**. Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

The proposed plan is a fine example of research, documentation, adaptive use, and restoration to return the site and its contributing buildings back to their period of significance. The applicant has identified the various elements of both buildings to determine the defining and original characteristics of both exterior and interior elements. The plan allows these features to remain in place while designing a very useable residential floor plan. This approach is an accomplishment to preservation planning and skilled adaptive use to preserve one remaining example of period church architecture within the City of Orange.

Issue 1 – Parking:

The living area of the Parsonage is considered as an accessory second-unit, combined with the re-use of the church to residential use will require a total of three parking spaces. The existing one car garage and two additional parallel parking spaces installed behind the gate along the north wall of the church building.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

1. ***In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).***

   The removal of non-historic material and the documentation and restoration of both the church and parsonage back to its period of significance furthers preservation of the site and district. Upon completion, the parsonage building will be reclassified as a secondary contributing building to the property.

2. ***In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2 and OTDS.)***

   The removal of non-historic material and the documentation and restoration of both the church and parsonage back to its period of significance furthers preservation of the site and district. Upon completion, the parsonage building will be reclassified as a secondary contributing building to the property.

3. ***The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).***

   With the restoration completed the work will conform to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the Design Review Committee. The proposal shall be based upon sound principles of land use and comply with the Old Towne Design Standards and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

4. ***For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).***

   As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to projects located within the Old Towne Orange Historic District, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

Staff recommends the Design Review Committee approve DRC 4601-11 subject to the conditions listed below and any conditions that the Design Review Committee deems appropriate:

1. All construction shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with project proposal packet dated November 7, 2011 and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. Applicant to maintain use of the one-car garage and provide two additional parallel parking spaces along the rear of the church building for the residential use of the church building.
3. Prior to building permit issuance, all required parking spaces shall be shown on construction documents as doubled striped to City standards at the time of approval.

The following code provisions are applicable to this project and are included for information only. This is not a complete list of requirements and other code provisions may apply.

- Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall pay all applicable development fees, including but not limited to: City sewer connection, Orange County Sanitation District Connection Fee, Transportation System Improvement Program, Fire Facility, Police Facility, Park Acquisition, Sanitation District, and School District, as required.
- Building permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this design review permit.
- All structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code – Chapter 15.52 (Building Security Standards), which relates to hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc. (Ord. 7-79). Approved structural drawings shall include sections of the security code that apply. Specifications, details, or security notes may be used to convey the compliance.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Bound Small Scale Project Proposal, dated November 7, 2011

CC:

Kris Olsen
Chapman University
One University Drive,
Orange, Ca 92866
714.997.6815

Troy Aday
Aday Architects
150 E. Meda, Suite 150
Glendora, Ca 91741
626.963.4044